1																		
2																		
3																		
4																		
5	NAS	SSF	Y U	(C 0	Ul	Ί	Υ	Ι	ΞE	G	Ι	S	L Z	ΙŁ	' U	R.	Ε
6																		
7																		
8																		
9																		
LO	FULI	. I	Έ	G :	ΙS	LZ	ΑΤ	I	VE	S	С	0	М	M I	Ι]	. T	E :	Ε
L1																		
L2																		
L3																		
L 4						i (
L 5		I I	- E	5.	Lu		.1 9		O 1	- 1	Τ	C	E	Т				
L 6																		
L7																		
L8																		
L 9	1 5	550	1	F.	ra	n l	ا ا	i	n	ΖΔ	7.7	Δ	n	11 6	2			
20	10	Mi													-			
21																		
22	Mor	n d =	9 <i>\</i> 7	_	N	7 0	;7 ←	m	h e	י ב		2	1	_	2	> N	1	6
23	1101					2						_	_	,	_	. 0	_	J
24																		
25																		

1

- 2 APPEARANCES:
- 3 NORMA GONSALVES, Presiding Officer
- 4 RICHARD NICOLELLO,
 Deputy Presiding Officer

5

HOWARD KOPEL,

- 6 Alternate Deputy Presiding Officer
- 7 STEVEN RHOADS
- 8 DENISE FORD
- 9 LAURA CURRAN
- 10 C. WILLIAM GAYLOR III
- 11 VINCENT MUSCARELLA
- 12 ELLEN BIRNBAUM
- 13 LAURA SCHAEFER
- 14 DONALD MACKENZIE
- 15 KEVAN ABRAHAMS, Minority Leader
- 16
 - ROSE MARIE WALKER
- 17
 - DENNIS DUNNE

18

ARNOLD DRUCKER

19

JAMES KENNEDY

20

DELIA DERIGGI-WHITTON

21

CARRIE SOLAGES

22

SIELA BYNOE

23

- MICHAEL PULITZER,
- 24 Clerk of the Legislature

25

1	
2	LIST OF SPEAKERS
3	PETER PATERSON
4	
5	CHIEF SKRYNECKI
6	ARNOLD DRUCKER13
7	JOANNE BORDEN21
8	TOM BRUNO26
	JAMIE BOGENSHUTZ26
9	PAT BOYLE29
10	DR. JEFFREY REYNOLDS
11	JOSEPH SMITH
12	ALEC SLATKY
13	
14	WILLENE JACOBS41
15	HEIDI SANFT43
16	BARBARA BORUM45
17	JACK MCCLOY50
	META MEREDAY53
18	RICH SCHURIN57
19	ANTHONY ARCURI66
20	CONAL DENION
21	ERIC NAUGHTON84
22	
23	MAURICE CHALMERS88
24	GERALD PODLESAK134
	MARTIN KATZ141

25

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: We will
- 3 begin with Dennis Dunne, please lead us in
- 4 the Pledge of Allegiance.
- 5 (Whereupon, the Pledge of
- 6 Allegiance was recited.)
- 7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you
- 8 very much, Legislator Gaylor. Mr. Pulitzer,
- 9 please call the roll.
- 10 CLERK PULITZER: Thank you,
- 11 ma'am. Deputy Presiding Officer Richard
- 12 Nicolello?
- 13 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Here.
- 14 CLERK PULITZER: Alternate Deputy
- 15 Presiding Officer Howard Kopel?
- 16 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Here.
- 17 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator Siela
- 18 Bynoe?
- 19 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: Here.
- 20 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator
- 21 Carrie Solages?
- 22 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: Here.
- 23 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator
- 24 Denise Ford?
- LEGISLATOR FORD: Here.

1 Full Legislature/11-21-	- 1 6
---------------------------	-------

- 2 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator Laura
- 3 Curran?
- 4 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: Here.
- 5 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator C.
- 6 William Gaylor III?
- 7 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Here.
- 8 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator
- 9 Vincent Muscarella?
- 10 LEGISLATOR MUSCARELLA: Here.
- 11 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator Ellen
- 12 Birnbaum?
- 13 LEGISLATOR BIRNBAUM: Here.
- 14 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator Delia
- 15 DeRiggi-Whitton?
- 16 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:
- Here.
- 18 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator James
- 19 Kennedy?
- LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: Here.
- 21 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator Laura
- 22 Schaefer?
- LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: Here.
- 24 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator
- 25 Dennis Dunne?

1	Full	Legislature/	1 1	1-21-16
---	------	--------------	-----	---------

- 2 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Here.
- 3 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator, and
- 4 welcome, Arnold Drucker?
- 5 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Here.
- 6 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator
- 7 Rosemarie Walker?
- 8 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Here.
- 9 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator
- 10 Donald MacKenzie?
- 11 LEGISLATOR MACKENZIE: Here.
- 12 CLERK PULITZER: Legislator
- 13 Steven Rhoads?
- 14 LEGISLATOR RHOADS: Present.
- 15 CLERK PULITZER: Minority Leader
- 16 Kevan Abrahams?
- 17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Here.
- 18 CLERK PULITZER: Presiding Officer
- 19 Norma Gonsalves?
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Present.
- 21 CLERK PULITZER: We have a
- 22 quorum.
- 23 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you
- 24 very much, Mr. Pulitzer.
- Each Full Legislature meeting, we

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 honor top cops. Today is no exception and
- 3 we have two top cops that will be honored by
- 4 this body.
- 5 I believe we have Mr. Paterson
- 6 from the PBA to come up and speak together
- 7 with the chief of the department, Steven
- 8 Skrynecki. We have two I believe.
- 9 MR. PATERSON: Once again we're
- 10 here to thank you for honoring two of our
- 11 finest.
- 12 When you hear this particular
- 13 story this month, it's going to take a
- 14 unique meaning. Unfortunately, over the
- 15 last weekend, the law enforcement community
- 16 had a real bad weekend. We had four cops
- 17 shot. One assassinated down in San Antonio.
- 18 It just goes to show what's going on in this
- 19 country unfortunately.
- 20 Our profession has turned from a
- 21 very dangerous profession to a very very
- 22 dangerous profession every day whether
- 23 you're in San Antonio, Dallas, or Nassau
- 24 County, you're coming across some bad
- 25 situations. I hope everybody really -- I

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 know this body does, but I hope everybody
- 3 sits back and reflects and really respects
- 4 what our officers do each and every day.
- 5 I will start off with the story.
- 6 This month, this Legislative body is
- 7 honoring Police Officer Charles Samolinski
- 8 and Police Officer Christopher Accordino.
- 9 The two police officers were
- 10 assigned to the third precinct. They were
- 11 over in the Uniondale area which is 323 car.
- 12 They were on patrol doing what they do.
- 13 They notice just on the other
- 14 side of the border, to the village of
- 15 Hempstead, two subjects involved in a
- 16 violent fight.
- 17 Upon approaching, they exited the
- 18 vehicle and started giving them orders to
- 19 stop the fight. While the two subjects
- 20 refused, and kept on fighting, both officers
- 21 suddenly realize that one subject's had --
- 22 was armed with a firearm.
- 23 They both drew their guns and
- 24 ordered them to stop fighting and
- 25 immediately secured the scene. They placed

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 the subject in handcuffs and thank God
- 3 nobody was hurt, especially the officers.
- 4 Hempstead Village Police Officers
- 5 came by and subsequently both subjects were
- 6 arrested on a related domestic incident plus
- 7 the possession of the weapon.
- 8 Another unique thing about this
- 9 story is, Police Officer Christopher
- 10 Accordino was on field training at the time
- 11 and he hadn't even graduated out of the
- 12 academy.
- 13 If you remember, unfortunately we
- 14 lost a New York city sergeant last month,
- and the police officer who took out, how we
- 16 say the bad guy, was also on field training.
- 17 That just goes to show you, when
- 18 these guys are out here, when you come out
- 19 of training, you're not quite a full police
- 20 officer, yet you come across something like
- 21 this. Both officers acted professionally
- 22 and the new guy, the recruit, showed the
- 23 wherewithal to say, yeah, I'm a police
- 24 officer, and he did a great job.
- Once again, we thank this

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Legislative body for recognizing these two
- 3 officers.
- 4 CHIEF SKRYNECKI: Thank you.
- 5 Just to echo Peter's remarks, first I would
- 6 like to say thank you again, to every member
- 7 of the Legislature for recognizing our
- 8 officers each month and your continued
- 9 support for the police department which we
- 10 value tremendously.
- 11 As Pete just said, this is a
- 12 tough time to be a police officer no matter
- 13 where you are. It's rare or it's a struggle
- 14 it seems to get public recognition for
- 15 police officers and their fine work and
- 16 truly you set the tone for that and we very
- 17 much appreciate that.
- The story you just heard is a
- 19 reflection of the great quality police
- 20 officers that we have. This is self
- 21 initiated work. This is not on a radio
- 22 call. This is not on an assignment. These
- 23 are two officers who are driving around on
- 24 their post looking for the things that they
- 25 should be looking for, things that look

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 suspicious, things that look unusual,
- 3 things, that are troubling to society. They
- 4 see two people engage in a fight, they take
- 5 appropriate action and, low and behold, one
- 6 of them is armed with a loaded weapon which
- 7 could be a horrific end to that story had it
- 8 not been for the incredible restraint on the
- 9 part of these officers, on their good
- 10 judgment, on how they can manage the
- 11 situation, and this you're hearing
- 12 repeatedly now here in Nassau County
- 13 particularly, which is our officers are
- 14 managing situations like this that could
- 15 significantly different. They're managing
- 16 them in a way where nobody gets hurt,
- 17 neither themselves, the public at large, or
- 18 the subject that they're apprehending.
- 19 So, we really want to applaud the
- 20 ability that they have to analyze a
- 21 situation, consider their options and
- 22 exercise the right option.
- I will end by saying this, it's
- 24 also a great reflection of our police
- 25 academy and the staff in our police academy

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 who is preparing these officers on their
- 3 very first day to carry themselves the way
- 4 they are.
- 5 So, a lot of really good things
- 6 happening here. Congratulations to our
- 7 officers again. Thank you all so much for
- 8 acknowledging us and Happy Thanksgiving to
- 9 all of you.
- 10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Would
- 11 either of the officers like to say
- 12 something? Who is the new kid on the block?
- 13 Would you like to say something.
- 14 MR. PATERSON: It is an active
- 15 case, they really can't talk much about the
- 16 case themselves.
- 17 OFFICER SAMOLINSKI: Thank you.
- 18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I'm glad I
- 19 heard his voice. He said thank you. The
- 20 other gentleman I'm sure would say the same
- 21 thing.
- OFFICER ACCORDINO: Yes, thank
- 23 you very much.
- 24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: You're
- 25 welcome. It's our pleasure.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- We are gathering for a photo,
- 3 each of the officers will receive a citation
- 4 signed by every one of the Legislators on
- 5 this body.
- 6 The size of the citation,
- 7 warrants, of course, the signatures of
- 8 everyone, all 19 of us on this citation.
- 9 Officer Samolinski and Officer
- 10 Accordino.
- Now I'm going to ask Senator
- 12 Kaminsky, are you here? Where are you? And
- 13 Mr. Drucker, would you please go down to the
- 14 well to be inducted. Is Mrs. Drucker here?
- 15 I think she should come up in.
- 16 For everyone who doesn't know
- 17 what is going on, or assuming what is going
- 18 on, Mr. Drucker won the election on November
- 19 8th, filling the seat of our dear friend of
- 20 all of us, Legislator Jacobs, and installing
- 21 him today is going to be Senator Kaminsky
- 22 who also won re-election I believe on
- November 8th; am I correct?
- 24 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Yes.
- 25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Joining

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Mr. Drucker are members of his family.
- 3 Without any further ado, Senator
- 4 Kaminsky will now formally induct Legislator
- 5 Drucker to this body. Let's go.
- 6 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Do you still
- 7 want to do this?
- 8 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Too late
- 9 now. I already signed the oath card.
- 10 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Please raise
- 11 your hand. I.
- 12 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: I.
- 13 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Arnold
- 14 Drucker.
- 15 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Arnold
- 16 Drucker.
- 17 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Do solemnly
- 18 swear to uphold the constitution of the
- 19 United States.
- 20 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Do solemnly
- 21 swear to uphold the Constitution of the
- 22 United States.
- SENATOR KAMINSKY: The
- 24 Constitution of the State of New York.
- 25 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: The

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Constitution of the State of New York.
- 3 SENATOR KAMINSKY: And the
- 4 Charter and laws of Nassau County.
- 5 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: And the
- 6 Charter and laws of Nassau County.
- 7 SENATOR KAMINSKY: And to
- 8 discharge the duties of the office of Nassau
- 9 County legislator.
- 10 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: And to
- 11 discharge the duties of the office of Nassau
- 12 County legislator.
- SENATOR KAMINSKY: To the best of
- 14 my ability.
- 15 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: To the best
- 16 of my ability.
- 17 SENATOR KAMINSKY: So help me
- 18 God.
- 19 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: So help me
- 20 God.
- 21 SENATOR KAMINSKY:
- 22 Congratulations.
- LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Thank you.
- Thank you, Todd. I'm honored
- 25 that you were able to administer the oath of

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 office to me so I can launch this new
- 3 challenge in my life. Thank you.
- I want to begin by just saying
- 5 that it is indeed an honor and a privilege
- 6 to serve on the Nassau County Legislature.
- 7 I believe that I was elected by
- 8 the voters of my district so that I can
- 9 carry on the legacy of Judy Jacobs' blessed
- 10 memory, who served on this esteemed
- 11 institution with grace, honor and
- 12 distinction for more than 20 years.
- Judy's commitment to her
- 14 constituents was to promote and deliver
- open, honest and transparent government to
- 16 all of her neighbors and fellow residents.
- 17 That is my commitment as well. I look
- 18 forward to rolling up my sleeves and getting
- 19 to work to fulfill that promise.
- 20 I would like to take this
- 21 opportunity to thank certain people who made
- 22 this day possible.
- First, I would like to thank
- 24 Chairman Jay Jacobs who believed that I
- 25 would be a worthy candidate to carry on the

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 legacy of Judy Jacobs. Thank you Jay for
- 3 your encouragement and support from day one.
- I would like to thank Executive
- 5 Director Mike Sanarono for all that you do
- 6 behind the scenes.
- 7 I would also like to thank my
- 8 number one coach and advisor, Dave Gugherty,
- 9 our Town of Oyster Bay leader. Your
- 10 day-to-day advice was invaluable and more
- importantly, comforting and reassuring.
- I would also like to thank my
- 13 assistant coach Matt Hines who led the way
- 14 in my campaign.
- I also need to thank Gaspar
- 16 Tuminello, Mark Cadushin, Mike Anderson and
- 17 Ben Lavender who were my boots on the ground
- 18 at events and campaigning at various places.
- 19 A special thanks to Bill
- 20 Bialmonte, Pet Kleins, and our
- 21 communications director Laura O'Corcorran
- 22 Doolan for all that you do.
- 23 As well as all those volunteers
- 24 at the Syosset headquarters who generously
- 25 gave so much of their time on my behalf.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 I would like to thank those noble
- 3 organizations who endorsed me and honored me
- 4 with your presence today such as the Long
- 5 Island Federation of Labor, The Nassau
- 6 County Sheriff's Correction Officers
- 7 Benevolent Association, the working Family's
- 8 Party and the Independence Party.
- 9 I, of course, need to thank all
- 10 of the voters in LD 16 who have entrusted me
- 11 to do my part to deliver good government to
- 12 them and I will not let them down.
- 13 Finally, I would like to thank
- 14 all my family members who are in attendance
- 15 today, as well as some of my dear, dear
- 16 friends here today, and some of my wonderful
- 17 staff at my law office in Queens who have
- 18 all supported me and encouraged me during
- 19 this endeavor.
- 20 And, last, but certainly not
- 21 least, I want to thank my children, Noah and
- 22 Rachel, and most of all my wife Frannie
- 23 whose love, encouragement and support has
- 24 meant the world to me. She has given it
- 25 unconditionally knowing full well that she

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 will now see me more infrequently than she
- 3 does already. I love you. Thank you all.
- 4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: At this
- 5 time I would like to congratulate you,
- 6 Legislator Drucker, and wish you the very
- 7 best in your endeavors and following through
- 8 on Judy Jacobs' goals and visions.
- 9 Congratulations on my part and
- 10 the part of the entire Legislature. But we
- 11 also have congratulations from the Minority
- 12 Leader Kevan Abrahams.
- 13 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Thank you,
- 14 Madam Presiding Officer. I promise to be
- 15 brief. It looks like we have a very full
- 16 agenda for today but I just wanted to again
- 17 express my congratulations to Arnie Drucker
- 18 who I have known for quite some time.
- 19 Obviously he's now joining us as
- 20 a colleague on behalf of all of our members,
- 21 not just the Democratic caucus, but the
- 22 entire Legislature as well, as well as all
- 23 the Nassau County residents, we wish to
- 24 congratulate you.
- 25 I think back to the first time

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 when I was first elected to office also in a
- 3 special election in 2002. I can say in jest
- 4 that there are some ups and downs. Could be
- 5 quite a few downs but definitely more ups.
- I can tell you that the job is
- 7 rewarding not just for yourself as well as
- 8 for your constituents, but rewarding for the
- 9 county to know that you are doing a
- 10 tremendous thing here today. I want to wish
- 11 congratulations to you, and to your family,
- 12 and obviously thank Senator Kaminsky for
- 13 swearing you in as well and all the best in
- 14 2016 and Happy Thanksgiving and all the best
- in the future of the remainder of the term.
- I want to take the opportunity, I
- do believe there are some elected officials
- 18 here with us today, and I just wanted to
- 19 recognize their acknowledgment as well,
- 20 Madam Presiding Officer, New York State
- 21 Assemblyman Chuck Lavine is here with us.
- 22 He might have left. North Hempstead Town
- 23 Clerk Wayne Wink. There's Wayne. And North
- 24 Hempstead Receiver of Taxes, Charley Berman.
- 25 And obviously Senator Kaminsky was here

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 earlier, but thank you again for this brief
- 3 moment, Madam Presiding Officer.
- 4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: There are
- 5 a number of slips that have been put before
- 6 me. I would like to get to each and every
- 7 one of them before we go to the Full
- 8 Legislature calendar for today so that
- 9 people who need to leave will have the
- 10 opportunity to do so.
- 11 The first slip that I have and,
- 12 by the way, we have a new addition to the
- 13 chamber and it's right in front of us and it
- 14 will be monitored by our clerk,
- 15 Mr. Pulitzer.
- So, without any further ado, and
- 17 I hope she's feeling fine, I call on Joanne
- 18 Borden.
- MS. BORDEN: Good afternoon. My
- 20 illness prevented me from saying this sooner
- 21 but I want to express my deep admiration,
- 22 respect and affection for the recently
- 23 departed Legislator Judith Jacobs.
- She tirelessly fought for many
- 25 causes to help her constituents all the

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 people of Nassau County. She encouraged me
- 3 to continue our fight for transgender human
- 4 rights and thus make her Human Rights Law
- 5 include everyone as she always intended.
- 6 We never lost that fight because
- 7 we never abandoned it and we will never give
- 8 up. Because human rights are right for
- 9 every human being.
- Judy, rest in peace, we are on
- 11 the right side of Americanism, history and
- 12 humanity, and I will be obdurate.
- 13 Furthermore, I know the
- 14 Republican opponents, regardless of their
- 15 actions, also know unconditional protection
- 16 of all our rights for all our citizens is
- 17 the first order of a legislator's duty and
- 18 responsibility.
- 19 So I say we transgender people
- 20 may be considered different because we do
- 21 not fit the sex we were labeled with at
- 22 birth.
- However, science says we were
- 24 born transgender. Our difference does not
- 25 mean that we should be separated,

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 subjugated, discriminated against, or the
- 3 recipients of prejudice.
- 4 It is time to dispense with all
- 5 that ancient 4,000 year old stuff. For the
- 6 most part, we are good and moral citizens.
- 7 Human rights were not meant for some select
- 8 citizens.
- 9 So in the name of serving God,
- 10 country and Nassau County I ask you for
- 11 common plain decency. Define gender
- 12 identity and gender expression in our law.
- 13 It was God who made us this way.
- 14 So he must have intended for us to be this
- 15 way. Thank you for listening.
- 16 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Minority
- 17 Leader.
- 18 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Joanne,
- 19 welcome back. We haven't seen you in some
- 20 time. We're glad to see you back. It was a
- 21 couple of meetings ago, I believe one of
- 22 your friends mentioned that you were being
- 23 hospitalized and everyone was obviously
- 24 concerned, bit we are glad to see you here
- 25 today and we are hoping that you are feeling

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 better and your health in on the mend.
- 3 Obviously you mentioned some
- 4 comments about Judy. You know how very well
- 5 how dear Judy was to all the members here on
- 6 this body and how we respected her for the
- 7 last, over the last 20 years, and is such a
- 8 tremendous loss to this body.
- 9 With that being said, I just want
- 10 to make sure you know, though I know Judy
- 11 was one of your most public and advocate
- 12 supporters, that your concerns will not fall
- 13 on deaf ears.
- 14 We will continue to fight for
- 15 your concerns to make sure those protections
- 16 are in that law. And I will make it my
- 17 personal pledge, not just for Judy Jacobs
- 18 but for the transgender community, to ensure
- 19 that every single person that feels that
- 20 they can be subjected to some level of
- 21 discrimination will have that protection in
- 22 the law.
- MS. BORDEN: Thank you. And I
- 24 have a side note for Norma. I still have
- 25 eight lives left. I only spent one in the

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 hospital.
- 3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: And you
- 4 have another birthday coming up on December
- 5 9th.
- 6 MS. BORDEN: You always say the
- 7 9th, it's the 6th.
- 8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Isn't it a
- 9 good thing?
- MS. BORDEN: You got the number
- 11 upside down.
- 12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: What day
- is it, Joanne?
- MS. BORDEN: I lost my hearing
- 15 aid, what can I tell you.
- 16 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Is it
- 17 December 6th?
- MS. BORDEN: Yes.
- 19 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Well, a
- 20 happy birthday and continued good health.
- 21 It was nice to see you and you were missed
- 22 for the past couple of meetings.
- MS. BORDEN: All the tubes are
- 24 out of me now and I'm recuperating.
- 25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Okay. So

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 you're ready to do a dance. Thank you,
- 3 Joanne. Tom Bruno.
- 4 MR. BRUNO: Good afternoon.
- 5 You probably haven't seen us here
- 6 for a couple of weeks because we felt as
- 7 though things were going to be okay.
- But, recently, I'm calling to
- 9 speak to you about the Nassau County budget
- 10 for 2017. I know you all have a very tough
- 11 decision to make in the next couple of days.
- 12 We as a coalition of youth service agencies
- 13 have stood before you many times and we are
- 14 here again today to ask you to please do all
- 15 that you can to ensure that the youth
- 16 services in this county continue to be
- 17 funded at full. Thank you very much.
- 18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: You're
- 19 welcome. Jamie.
- MS. BOGENSHUTZ: Good afternoon.
- 21 My name is Jamie Bogenshutz. I'm the
- 22 Executive Director of Yes Community
- 23 Counseling Center and we have our resources,
- 24 our building in Massapequa serving the south
- 25 shore and Levittown, Island Trees

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 communities.
- 3 I'm here today with my colleagues
- 4 once again to talk to you about what Tom
- 5 just mentioned about youth services and
- 6 funding for youth services.
- 7 It's funny because we stood here
- 8 earlier before and we were celebrating the
- 9 valiant efforts of our amazing police force
- 10 and, interestingly enough, we have a lot in
- 11 common. They serve and protect. We serve
- 12 and protect. They see people at their
- 13 darkest hours. We see people at their
- 14 darkest hours. Abused, addicted, depressed,
- 15 suicidal, bereaved and lost. They save
- 16 lives and we save lives.
- 17 As a matter of fact, one of my
- 18 social workers performed the Heimlich
- 19 maneuver on an eight year old little girl
- 20 last week and saved her life.
- 21 They prevent tragedies in our
- 22 neighborhoods and we prevent tragedies in
- 23 our neighborhoods. You might think that
- 24 those similarities should catapult us to the
- 25 top of the list of any list that would say,

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 you're not go to ever touch them because we
- 3 need them in our communities to keep
- 4 everyone safe and healthy.
- 5 Yet, as we sit here today, both
- 6 of our groups are being considered for
- 7 dramatic funding reductions and even
- 8 elimination. So you might say that this is
- 9 not in your hands, that this is all in the
- 10 hands of NIFA at this point. But we know
- 11 that there is much that you can do. We know
- 12 that you can get us off the table.
- The way you get us off the table
- 14 is by finding other options and alternatives
- 15 that keep this budget whole and keep NIFA
- 16 away from us. Without our services, without
- 17 our system in place, we are going to lose
- 18 lots and lots of young people in this
- 19 community. Every single day, all of us and
- 20 all our agencies from Elmont to Massapequa
- 21 and all in between do nothing but save
- lives.
- We really need you to do whatever
- 24 it is that you can do in a bipartisan way.
- 25 This is not about this side or that side.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 It's about all of you working together to
- 3 ensure that we all stay safe. We are not
- 4 here year after year after year singing for
- 5 our supper.
- I went back through my notes and
- 7 I pulled out a speech, a presentation that I
- 8 made you to guys in 2003, and I could have
- 9 been reading it today. Except I would not
- 10 have been mentioning NIFA. So it's not
- 11 changing. It's not getting better. We need
- 12 you to do something to make sure we stay off
- 13 this chopping block.
- 14 The kids of this county are
- 15 looking to you to make sure they stay safe
- 16 and protected and we are looking to you for
- 17 the same thing.
- So, whatever you have to do,
- 19 where ever you have to find this money
- 20 please find it and get us out of harm's way.
- 21 Thank you.
- CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Pat Boyle.
- MR. BOYLE: Hello everyone. My
- 24 name is Pat Boyle. I work with Gateway
- 25 Youth Outreach in Elmont.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 First of all, Happy Thanksgiving.
- 3 I hope you have a joyous one and a pleasant
- 4 one with your families and whoever else you
- 5 are going to be with at that time.
- I would also like to welcome
- 7 Legislator Drucker. Congratulations. You
- 8 have some very, very big shoes to fill.
- 9 Judy Jacobs was an advocate for our cause on
- 10 a regular basis like she was for so many
- 11 others. I hope you can find it in your
- 12 heart to be able to do the same thing.
- I want to talk to you about two
- 14 different things. I read that editorial in
- 15 Newsday today. I agree it's an editorial,
- 16 not any of you talking, not anything going
- on there, but it really kind of made me a
- 18 little nervous.
- The bottom line is if some kind
- 20 of funding isn't found or some kind of
- 21 revenue stream isn't found or some kind of
- 22 cuts are going to be made, we know we are
- 23 non mandated services, discretionary
- 24 services.
- 25 But I think after what Jamie

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 talked to you about, I don't know how you
- 3 can feel we are actually those types of
- 4 things.
- 5 One thing that I'm thinking about
- 6 is, the one thing that could help us in the
- 7 future, I don't know how you're going to do
- 8 it or maybe it's time that we do become
- 9 mandated services. Maybe it's time we start
- 10 working with the state and maybe it's time
- 11 we start working with the Legislature here
- 12 to make sure we are not put on the chopping
- 13 block every year.
- 14 It's not like we're asking for
- 15 more money. We're just asking for what we
- 16 got in the past. 1989. That's the last
- 17 time we received any kind of funding
- 18 increase and it was small at that time. 27
- 19 years ago.
- We've managed to go out and find
- 21 other monies to be able to plug the holes as
- 22 far as being able to make sure we are able
- 23 to pay our bills. Which we have. We run
- 24 businesses. We don't run nice little social
- 25 service agencies. These are businesses we

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 are running.
- I like the clock by the way, it
- 4 keeps you on time.
- 5 The other thing that I wanted to
- 6 talk to you about was contracts. Contracts
- 7 haven't started going out yet. It's not
- 8 that I don't think commissioners don't want
- 9 them to go out. I think they do. The
- 10 problem with that is, if they don't go out
- 11 soon even if we are funded in next year's
- 12 budget, which I really believe you're going
- 13 to work hard to do, we're not going to see
- 14 any money until June. That also puts us in
- 15 a bad way as well too.
- So I think what we need to do is
- 17 be able to make sure we are able to start --
- 18 the budget is passed, as far as I know,
- 19 we're in it.
- 20 So if the contracts can go out as
- 21 soon as possible then we can get the
- 22 paperwork back and be funded and we can make
- 23 ourselves work as businesses. We all know
- 24 that everyone who runs a business knows it's
- 25 hard to run one without funding. Thank you

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 very much.
- 3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,
- 4 Pat. Dr. Reynolds.
- DR. REYNOLDS: Good afternoon.
- 6 I'm Dr. Jeffrey Reynolds. I'm the president
- 7 and CEO of Family and Children's
- 8 Association.
- 9 I noticed, Legislator Gonsalves,
- 10 that you knew Joanne's birthday, and I hope
- 11 that I'm not here often enough so that you
- 12 come to know my birthday.
- But it does feel like we're here
- 14 year after year after year talking about the
- 15 need for youth services and arguing once
- 16 again for our survival. I will tell you in
- 17 the past week since it's become known that
- 18 once again youth services are on the
- 19 chopping block, I have gotten calls from
- 20 residents at the county's only runaway at
- 21 homeless youth shelter asking if we are
- 22 going to stay open.
- I have gotten calls from staff
- 24 about whether or not they are going to have
- 25 a job come the holidays. I have gotten calls

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 from federal and state funding sources who
- 3 have said we kick in to make this all work,
- 4 are you going to continue to have funding
- 5 and should we continue to fund you?
- 6 So the destabilization of these
- 7 services is happening system wide at a time
- 8 when we can least afford it.
- 9 Almost all of you at one point or
- 10 another, if you haven't then you should have
- 11 spoken out about this region's heroin
- 12 crisis. Most of you have done so very,
- 13 very, very aggressively. That's good,
- 14 because it's one of the worst public health
- 15 crises we have seen in this region.
- 16 You need to connect the dots and
- 17 understand that the services we're talking
- 18 about or the lack thereof have a big impact
- 19 on what happens with this crisis.
- When we talk about a place where
- 21 kids and family to go after school, we're
- 22 talking about services that protect kids and
- 23 keep them safe from drugs and alcohol.
- 24 When we talk about school based
- 25 programs or judicial diversion programs, we

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 are talking about the very things that
- 3 because they have been chronically unfunded,
- 4 have led us to this point.
- 5 Quite frankly, I want 2017 to be
- 6 the year where we turn the corner in terms
- 7 of this crisis. When we see a drop in
- 8 deaths among 13 to 17 year olds. Where we
- 9 see fewer kids being locked up, fewer
- 10 parents grieving the loss of their kids.
- 11 Cutting these services virtually guarantees
- 12 that 2017 will mean even more fatalities and
- 13 deaths.
- I'm asking you with everything
- 15 that we have, please protect these services
- 16 and please make it so we don't have to spend
- 17 our time year after year coming to beg what
- 18 amounts to in the scheme of things are
- 19 relatively small amounts of money.
- 20 Please, more than anything,
- 21 connect the dots and understand what we do
- 22 today really matters in 2017 and beyond.
- So I thank you for your time and
- 24 attention.
- 25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Your

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 welcome, Dr. Reynolds. Joseph Smith,
- 3 MR. SMITH: Thank you. Before I
- 4 begin, I do want to extend my thoughts about
- 5 the loss of a great leader, Judy Jacobs. It
- 6 was my pleasure to have known Judy from the
- 7 very first beginning of this Legislature.
- 8 Like so many of you have said, and so many
- 9 of you have felt, her loss is just very,
- 10 very hard to even imagine having happened
- 11 but it has.
- I welcome you, Mr. Drucker, and I
- 13 know that you will do everything you can to
- 14 live up to Judy's image and to Judy's
- 15 reputation and to her efforts on behalf of
- 16 the residents of Nassau County.
- So, on that note, as Jaime said
- 18 before, I too have gone through notes from
- 19 the past over the years. I have spoken
- 20 before this Legislature many many times on
- 21 the same topic; youth services. Critical
- 22 services. Essential services. That
- 23 unfortunately have been labeled
- 24 discretionary services.
- But our kids, your kids, my kids

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 are not discretionary. The children of
- 3 Nassau County, the families of Nassau County
- 4 rely on professional services to be able to
- 5 live decent lives, to be able to have a
- 6 sense of hope and opportunity, and not to
- 7 fall prey to things like heroin addiction,
- 8 to things like juvenile and adult criminal
- 9 behavior, to things like mental disorders
- 10 and suicide.
- 11 And it's through the services
- 12 that we have made available over the years
- 13 and the systems we have built and the
- 14 coordination of services in our communities
- 15 that have helped to save lives.
- Without those services, our
- 17 communities will not be the kind of quality
- 18 of life that we want for the residents of
- 19 Nassau County.
- Each of you were elected. Each
- 21 of you were elected to represent the people
- 22 in your communities. We didn't elect NIFA.
- 23 How dare, how dare we come to the point that
- 24 unelected people can make decisions to
- 25 affect the quality of life in Nassau County.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 One of the wealthiest counties in America.
- 3 There's something wrong with it picture.
- 4 When the needs of young people
- 5 and the needs of families are turned over to
- 6 unelected people, there's something wrong.
- 7 You have a responsibility to do
- 8 whatever you need to do to balance a budget
- 9 and not to do it on the backs of the
- 10 children of Nassau County. Thank you.
- 11 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,
- 12 Mr. Smith. Alec Slatky. Speak now or when
- 13 the item comes up.
- MR. SLATKY: I'll speak now.
- 15 Good afternoon. My name is Alec Slatky and
- 16 I'm here representing Triple A Northeast.
- 17 Serves as a membership of about 300,000
- 18 Nassau County residents.
- 19 I'm sorry if I'm a little bit
- 20 groggy or disheveled, I actually flew in
- 21 from Hawaii on a red eye, I was on vacation.
- 22 The weather was fabulous. Even when it
- 23 rained it was actually quite pleasant.
- Unfortunately, this is a very
- 25 forced transition, the only damper on the

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 trip was the news that the public safety fee
- 3 was being reinstated or planned to be
- 4 reinstated today at a lower level of \$55.
- 5 That's still unacceptable to us.
- The reason is, it just violates
- 7 state law in our opinion. The state law
- 8 says the fine for red light camera ticket in
- 9 Nassau County is \$50. And Nassau County now
- 10 wants to say it's \$150. To me it's
- 11 obviously that that's in conflict and I
- don't have any sympathy for blatant red
- 13 light runners.
- 14 As a matter of fact I went down
- 15 to a conference. I spoke at a conference,
- 16 the Insurance Institute for Highway safety
- 17 about red light cameras and I praised Nassau
- 18 County's red light camera program because I
- 19 think there is a positive safety benefit.
- 20 But the main issue here is that
- 21 when you use traffic enforcement to balance
- 22 the budget, then you lose that connection
- 23 between the traffic enforcement and traffic
- 24 safety.
- The reason why I'm personally

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 aggrieved by this is that I'd spent a lot of
- 3 time thinking about -- and I know a lot
- 4 about academics and people in the
- 5 transportation sector, criminal justice
- 6 sector, think about how to set fines to
- 7 balance the turns in traffic safety with the
- 8 need for proportionality and the need to not
- 9 be so punitive, but it seems like here the
- 10 balance is between the need to raise revenue
- 11 for the county and the need to avoid
- 12 political consequences for doing so.
- 13 If someone came up to me and said
- 14 that this was done -- it was retracted, the
- 15 fee was retracted and put back in today for
- 16 political reasons, I don't know what to say.
- 17 I don't know if I can argue against it.
- It's very frustrating because I
- 19 think there's a real bad precedent that's
- 20 set here today. And now we're saying that
- 21 any city, any county, any village in New
- 22 York State can add whatever fee they want to
- 23 a traffic ticket, I think that traffic
- 24 tickets should be about safety.
- I think that's being lost here

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 today if you're adding this \$55 fee.
- I'm happy to continue the
- 4 conversation with you but I think really the
- 5 public safety fee in any format is a
- 6 disgrace really.
- 7 I think there's still time. I
- 8 hope you believe that this is bad public
- 9 policy and that's why I think you stopped it
- 10 initially. There's still time here today to
- 11 vote your conscience. I don't want to be a
- 12 Ted Cruz but happy to continue the
- 13 conversation at any point in the future and
- 14 thank you for having me here today.
- 15 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: You're
- 16 welcome, Mr. Slatky. Willene Jacobs.
- 17 MS. JACOBS: Yes. Good
- 18 afternoon. I do want to make a public
- 19 comment regarding the resolution in regard
- 20 to the LED signs for the Bellmore Fire
- 21 District. Of course Uniondale is definitely
- 22 in agreement with that, anything for the
- 23 fire department, as our Uniondale Fire
- 24 Department is in stance with us for
- 25 beautification for Uniondale.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- Ms. Gonzalves, have you tabled
- 3 the contract B-11-16 for the Uniondale
- 4 street scraping project? Was that a no?
- 5 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: It's not
- 6 part of today's calendar,
- 7 MS. JACOBS: Given that response,
- 8 it is extremely disappointing and
- 9 discouraging that the Uniondale street
- 10 scaping project, B-11-16 has not been put on
- 11 the legislative agenda.
- The majority of Uniondale
- 13 residents strongly believe that this is yet
- 14 another manipulative and orchestrated tactic
- 15 to further disenfranchise a historically
- 16 underserved minority community.
- 17 Our thoughts are neither
- 18 disillusional or fabricated. We understand
- 19 that the struggle is indeed real.
- The residents of Uniondale are
- 21 united and will stand up against injustice
- 22 and systematic discriminatory practices.
- 23 Thank you.
- 24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: You're
- 25 welcome. Jack McCloy.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Madam
- 3 Presiding Officer, is that Pearl and Heidi,
- 4 are there any other speakers? I was going
- 5 to make a comment but I didn't want to
- 6 comment and cut anybody off.
- 7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Fill out a
- 8 slip.
- 9 MS. SANFT: I will, right after
- 10 this. My name is Heidi Sanft.
- 11 What I want to stay is that I'm
- 12 in complete agreement with Pearl and I know
- 13 that you don't know us and what we do for
- 14 the community but maybe you should.
- 15 For the last nine years, we have
- 16 put our blood and our guts and our time into
- 17 turning this community around. That's the
- 18 community of Uniondale.
- I own a business. Pearl is a
- 20 manager for a telecommunications company.
- 21 We should be working right now but we really
- 22 really care about Uniondale. That's where
- 23 we live.
- We've done things such as remove
- 25 litter from planters. We plant more than a

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 thousand flowers every day in Uniondale. We
- 3 go door to door and get people to clean up
- 4 their businesses. We don't get paid any
- 5 money for this.
- I see that you're congratulating
- 7 and taking pictures of different people that
- 8 do a great job such as the police. I think
- 9 that's great, but they are paid to do their
- 10 job. We do all of this for not one penny.
- 11 All of this lobbying for our community.
- 12 I should be working right now but
- 13 I'm here instead. Why? Because I devoted a
- 14 good part of my life to making a difference.
- 15 But we need your help and support.
- This money is there. The
- 17 contractor is selected. Please don't use
- 18 this -- don't use politics to stall
- 19 something that's long overdue.
- Like I said, Pearl doesn't get
- 21 paid. I don't get paid. We're supposed to
- 22 be at work both of us. This is the third
- 23 meeting in a row that we have come to you
- 24 when we have jobs waiting for us. I have
- 25 clients wondering where am I, and I'm here.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Why am I here?
- 3 I'm not here to waste time. Not
- 4 here to harass anybody. Not here to do
- 5 something negative.
- We're here to make good things
- 7 happen in a community that's really been
- 8 kind of shoved aside for quite a while.
- 9 So, all I'm saying is, please
- 10 just come together and figure out a way to
- 11 let this project move forward. You've got
- 12 really good caring people who are working
- 13 together, we've all put our egos aside.
- 14 It's not about me, me, me. We don't ask for
- 15 anything. So if you can just move it
- 16 forward, I'd appreciate it.
- 17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Fill out a
- 18 slip so you're part of the record. You need
- 19 to fill out a slip too. Your name?
- MS. BORUM: Barbara Borum. I
- 21 would just like to express and piggyback on
- 22 everything that Pearl and Heidi been saying.
- I would like for you, the
- 24 legislative board, to realize, this is not
- 25 about party. We represent people of all

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 parties.
- 3 Some of the people that you are
- 4 denying helped to put all of you or one of
- 5 you in this seat.
- 6 So let's forget about what party.
- 7 It's not about party. We have nonpartisan.
- 8 We can't like divide like you guys do. You
- 9 have to come together like we come together
- 10 as a community and stop thinking you are
- 11 helping this side, more than that side,
- 12 because there is a little of all of us in
- 13 all the communities. We the people put all
- 14 of you in the seats that you're in. Thank
- 15 you.
- 16 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,
- 17 Barbara. Jack McCloy.
- 18 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Give me one
- 19 second, Jack. I just wanted to respond. I
- 20 just wanted to thank Heidi, Pearl and Ms.
- 21 Borum for coming down today.
- 22 Obviously this has been
- 23 transpiring now for the last few weeks and I
- 24 think what Heidi said was, she said it best.
- 25 The folks that are coming down here, they're

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 not coming down here for any financial
- 3 benefit. They're coming down strictly for
- 4 their community, love of their area,
- 5 beautification of their area. Seeing their
- 6 area represent what they truly embody in
- 7 each and every one of themselves.
- I can tell you, and I'm speaking
- 9 now to our entire body, that all 19 of us,
- 10 how many times have we held a community
- 11 meeting and ten people show up, or 15 people
- 12 show up on any particular topic, and we wish
- 13 and employ and encourage people to show up
- 14 more, and care more.
- Here we have a group of people a
- 16 couple of weeks ago was well over 20 some
- 17 odd people. Today we have some of the
- 18 leaders from the Nostrand Garden Civic
- 19 Association. I mean this is what we are
- 20 looking for in Nassau County. This is what
- 21 makes our jobs as Nassau County Legislators
- 22 easier when we have that ability to build a
- 23 bridge to folks like this in the community
- 24 that care, that want to see their area be
- 25 enhanced, that call the police, are engaged

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 with the police. They want to see their
- 3 communities be safer.
- 4 It just seems like to me, today,
- 5 as well as for the last few weeks, we are
- 6 turning them away and we are turning our
- 7 backs to them. When, at a time when we
- 8 should be encouraging people to participate
- 9 in their government, and come up with ideas
- 10 and renditions to make sure our communities
- 11 are better and more enhanced, we are turning
- 12 backs to them over politics.
- So, I wanted to, again, thank
- 14 them for coming down today and voicing their
- 15 concerns on behalf of the entire Nostrand
- 16 Garden Civic Association.
- 17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Jack
- 18 McCloy.
- 19 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: Madam
- 20 Presiding Officer?
- 21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I have
- 22 three more speakers and I would like to take
- 23 them.
- 24 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: I'll be
- 25 brief.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Do you
- 3 know what time we started, Mr. Pulitzer?
- 4 CLERK PULITZER: About 25 to 30
- 5 minutes ago. I have three more speakers and
- 6 I would like to have them before I say
- 7 that's it. I don't want them to be here and
- 8 not be able to voice their concerns. You're
- 9 not going to have three minutes, you'll have
- 10 one.
- 11 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: I'll be
- 12 brief. Thank you very much, Presiding
- 13 Officer.
- 14 I just want to thank all those
- 15 persons from Uniondale who came here to
- 16 speak today. It was mentioned before
- 17 Legislator Judy Jacobs, may she rest in
- 18 peach, she was an outstanding legislator.
- 19 Also, this year, in 2016, we lost
- 20 many community leaders, people like Mel
- 21 Harris. Mel Harris served as the president
- 22 of that civic association worked also under
- 23 the County Executive.
- Going forward in April, I
- 25 understand that the coliseum will be

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 reopening, and I just think it would be
- 3 foolish to have just that side of Uniondale
- 4 redeveloped and not the other side of
- 5 Uniondale not redeveloped.
- 6 That's something that Mel Harris
- 7 -- and I don't know if my new seat comes
- 8 with a lower microphone, but I just think
- 9 that in good karma and upholding the legacy
- 10 of a man that worked for the county and
- 11 cared a lot about this great county, that we
- 12 reconsider this contract, Presiding Officer.
- I would truly appreciate that
- 14 going forward in working with you on behalf
- 15 of all of the residents of Nassau County.
- 16 Thank you.
- 17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Mr.
- 18 McCloy.
- 19 MR. MCCLOY: Thank you very much.
- 20 Happy Thanksgiving to all of you.
- 21 I would like to remind you that
- 22 I've attended every session for the last
- 23 year. I would like to remind you that the
- 24 reason, the main reason for that was my
- 25 opposition to the road diet that had been

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 proposed for Grand Avenue in Baldwin.
- 3 Since the last session, I want to
- 4 let you know that I had a discussion with my
- 5 legislator, Laura Curran, and we don't see
- 6 eye to eye on this but we see eye to eye on
- 7 some other important situations that I would
- 8 like to mention to you.
- 9 There was a community meeting
- 10 where Kevan and Laura attended in Baldwin
- 11 where the topic of discussion was the water
- 12 increase proposal and the recent October
- 13 26th public service hearing that occurred to
- 14 discuss that increase.
- I'd like to mention briefly to
- 16 you what I spoke about at that public
- 17 service meeting because I'm very happy to
- 18 say that I saw Laura at that meeting. I saw
- 19 Steven Rhoads at that meeting. I don't know
- 20 if others were there. I didn't hear anyone
- 21 else from the Legislature speak at that
- 22 meeting, but what I said was, many of us, we
- 23 get our bills, we pay our bills, we work, we
- 24 take care of family, and we repeat the
- 25 process day by day.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 What I do is I have the ability
- 3 to understand what other people pay for
- 4 water. My mom lives in Melville and I pay
- 5 her bills. This is a copy of her bill for
- 6 9,000 gallons of water in Melville. She
- 7 paid \$8 on her last bill.
- This is a copy of my last bill.
- 9 I paid for 14,000 gallons of water, a little
- 10 bit less than double. My bill was \$87.42.
- 11 It's not double, it's not triple, it's not
- 12 quadruple. It's insane that they are asking
- 13 for a rate increase on top of what they're
- 14 already getting.
- I really hope in the spirit of
- 16 Thanksgiving we can come together and look
- 17 at some of the issues that affect the
- 18 majority of Nassau County residents and in a
- 19 bipartisan way say, hey, listen, we can't
- 20 turn the screws any tighter.
- I don't know if any of you would
- 22 be interested in finding the specifics of
- 23 this but I do want to point out this out to
- 24 you that this is extremely high.
- 25 The final thing I would like to

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 mention to you about the budget is the fact
- 3 that I have been an advocate of fair red
- 4 light camera timing. I heard what Alec
- 5 Slatky mentioned about the red light camera
- 6 surcharge and the one thing I would like to
- 7 ask again, and I know my time is about ready
- 8 to end, but if a surcharge is to be placed
- 9 into effect, please make the yellow light
- 10 duration an acceptable time, and not an
- 11 entrapment type of situation. And at these
- 12 red light camera intersections, please post
- 13 a count down time which will allow the
- 14 oncoming traffic drivers to see what is
- 15 going to happen before the light changes
- 16 from green to yellow.
- 17 If somebody does blow through the
- 18 red light, give them a ticket, give them a
- 19 surcharge, but don't entrap otherwise safe
- 20 drivers. Thank you and Happy Thanksgiving.
- 21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: And to you
- 22 Mr. McCloy. Ms. Mereday.
- MS. MEREDAY: Meta J. Mereday,
- 24 Baldwin resident. That looks familiar from
- 25 the Town of Hempstead, so I think we should

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 have one kind of facing the other way as
- 3 well, that's just my two cents my three
- 4 minutes. Quite a few issues to talk about.
- I was opposed to the \$105, and
- 6 then when the discussion came about as to
- 7 where the fees were actually going to be
- 8 utilized, that was eye opening to me.
- 9 I just find it interesting that
- 10 numbers can be changed. Just wondering if
- 11 the discussion behind the scenes took place
- 12 with the controller with regard to the ideas
- 13 that he had in place.
- I have a concern, because, again,
- 15 most of the residents only find out in
- 16 Newsday because they can't attend these
- 17 activities during the middle of the day and
- 18 prior to a holiday because they are working.
- 19 I don't know if it's fortunate or
- 20 unfortunate that I work at night because
- 21 actually this is the time I should be doing
- 22 other things and possibly sleeping, but in
- 23 this county you can get no rest.
- The NICE Buses, that's a whole
- 25 other issue that was a grand plan from this

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 current administration in terms of
- 3 privatizing it and it would in fact save the
- 4 county and save the county residents money.
- 5 We seem to be paying more in subsidy for
- 6 this privatized project, another fail for
- 7 the county and also a detriment to the
- 8 residents.
- 9 Under probe in line for \$1.4
- 10 million contract, again, this speaks to the
- 11 issue that I have expressed on numerous
- 12 occasions about the lack of adequate vetting
- 13 for the contracts we have, we must act like
- 14 we're our own country. We don't even reach
- 15 out to the city of New York or the county of
- 16 Suffolk to find out if any of these
- 17 potential contractors who are getting multi,
- 18 million dollar contracts might have some
- 19 issues, might have a problem with that as
- $20 \quad \text{well.}$
- 21 Significant to what I'm always
- 22 addressing is the homelessness story. US
- 23 homelessness is down, Long Island is up a
- 24 bit.
- 25 I challenged the Long Island

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Coalition for homelessness back in the
- 3 summer when they made their bogus claim that
- 4 they had eradicated veteran homelessness on
- 5 Long Island when in fact national statistics
- 6 continue to show that 25 percent of the
- 7 nation's homeless residents are veterans.
- 8 So I don't understand how Long
- 9 Island's homelessness can be up but the
- 10 veteran homelessness is zero.
- 11 We have a significant issue that
- 12 we have to continue to address in this
- 13 county. We all talk about the epidemics and
- 14 heroin and things of that nature.
- 15 But if we continue to refuse to
- 16 address what we're not providing to our
- 17 veterans in Nassau County through a system
- 18 and an agency for the numbers and for the
- 19 limited budget, because no one is bringing
- 20 up that issue about the budget, and the
- 21 budget constraints that are impacting the
- 22 veteran services agency, that is ill
- 23 equipped ill advised in terms of the
- 24 services that they're providing. Thank you.
- 25 I should be back a little bit later if I

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 stay here long enough.
- 3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Rich, I
- 4 believe, Schurin.
- 5 MR. SCHURIN: Yes. Thank you and
- 6 good afternoon. I have a comment
- 7 specifically to you, Legislator Ford, but I
- 8 want all the other legislators to be aware
- 9 of it.
- 10 As you know, another pedestrian
- 11 was killed on Austin Boulevard a few weeks
- 12 ago. The road averages at least one
- 13 pedestrian death per year for many years.
- 14 The redevelopment of the project, the Austin
- 15 Boulevard project, has been in the works for
- 16 many many years and people keep on dying.
- 17 Literally dying.
- I was very disheartened to learn
- 19 that the project has been put on hold again
- 20 for at least two years I'm told because of
- 21 the reconstruction of the Barnum Isle
- 22 Bridge, and I'm here today to say to you
- 23 there is absolutely no reason that a safety
- 24 project like that needs to be put on hold
- 25 because of a traffic concern relating to the

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 reconstruction of a bridge.
- 3 I would urge you and all the
- 4 other legislators to take a look at that
- 5 because, if the statistics are correct, and
- 6 prove correct in the future, another person,
- 7 at least one more person, two more people
- 8 will die.
- 9 As you know, I live on the other
- 10 side, and I now have teenage children and
- 11 they cross that road. I tell them not to
- 12 but they do anyway. It's an extremely
- dangerous road and something needs to be
- 14 done. The bridge project should not stall
- 15 that. That's the first topic that I want to
- 16 raise.
- 17 The second topic is on the tax,
- 18 for the ticket tax, the motor vehicle ticket
- 19 tax. It's just a tax on -- further tax on
- 20 us residents. I spoke against it last time.
- 21 Cutting it in half is not the solution.
- The county's problems were
- 23 created by a corrupt assessment system, a
- 24 corrupt and inefficient assessment system,
- 25 which the Legislature is responsible for.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Hasn't been able to fix.
- 3 There's many other ways to save
- 4 money. It's the burden on the residents of
- 5 Nassau County, it's too much. This is
- 6 really just another tax.
- 7 I don't think you need to cut any
- 8 of the good youth programs that all the
- 9 people spoke out against. There's plenty of
- 10 savings all over the place. As you all
- 11 know, there's constantly people being hired
- 12 in the board of elections and other places
- 13 because of referrals and family members, et
- 14 cetera. There is lots of ways to save money
- in this county without asking the residents
- 16 of this county to pay more and more and
- 17 more. Thank you.
- 18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 19 Ford.
- 20 LEGISLATOR FORD: Mr. Schurin,
- 21 thank you very much for bringing up the
- 22 projects that we are doing in Island Park
- 23 specifically along Austin Boulevard. You're
- 24 right, we have been waiting a very long time
- 25 to reconstruct Austin Boulevard and

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 everything, we have the funding. Everything
- 3 is set for it to go.
- 4 Unfortunately, what had happened
- 5 was, New York State came down and inspected
- 6 all the bridges in our area and I guess they
- 7 might have done it all through New York
- 8 State.
- 9 They deemed the Barnum Island
- 10 Bridge to be in need of replacement because
- 11 of safety concerns.
- 12 The Barnum Island Bridge
- 13 reconstruction has nothing to about with
- 14 traffic patterns or alleviating any type of
- 15 traffic. What it is, it is a safety
- 16 project. That bridge is probably well over
- 17 70 years old and it needs to be replaced.
- 18 We were awarded funding by the
- 19 federal government and if we did not start
- 20 this project as we are starting it right
- 21 now, we would be in danger of losing that
- 22 money, go to another project, and we would
- 23 have to start the process over again trying
- 24 to get funding to replace that bridge which
- 25 may take ten years.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Because of Sandy it also helped
- 3 to expedite to a certain degree the
- 4 disrepair of the bridge. A lot of the
- 5 trucks that went over were overweight but
- 6 they needed to go over because homes were
- 7 being rebuilt and the construction companies
- 8 needed to get into the South Shore that way.
- 9 I understand the frustration and
- 10 this is something that going to the civic
- 11 meetings, and reporting it like sending
- 12 information to the Herald and having
- 13 community forums as well in regard to these
- 14 projects, this was something that I
- 15 expressed.
- 16 A lot of the residents who did
- 17 attend understand the fact that, yes, we do
- 18 need to redo Austin Boulevard, but this is
- 19 something more of a safety concern because
- 20 of the bridge and the condition that it's
- 21 in. It's two safety projects. We had to
- 22 pick one.
- MR. SCHURIN: I understand what
- 24 you're saying but, as you know, the
- 25 gentleman that was killed approximately two

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 miles from the bridge. There is aspects of
- 3 the project that can be done at the same
- 4 time. Children cross that road, the
- 5 entirety of that road. The bridge is only a
- 6 small part of that road. It's not true that
- 7 the county can not do these two projects
- 8 simultaneously. Maybe there are parts of it
- 9 that have to be put aside because of the
- 10 bridge, but there's other parts of it that
- 11 can be done.
- 12 If somebody thinks creatively and
- 13 somebody revises and tweaks the plan a
- 14 little bit, it can be done.
- So, I hear what you're saying,
- 16 what you're saying is true, but it's not
- 17 true that the Austin Boulevard safety plan,
- 18 entirety of the plan has to be put on hold
- 19 two years, and you know that.
- 20 LEGISLATOR FORD: I'm sorry you
- 21 don't agree, but our engineers have said
- 22 that and a lot of our emergency personnel
- 23 agree the fact that we need right at this
- 24 point to do one project at a time because
- 25 both of them are like big projects and we

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 are going to be redirecting traffic.
- 3 MR. SCHURIN: When you make a
- 4 choice, people's lies are at stake when you
- 5 make that choice.
- 6 LEGISLATOR FORD: Right. Thank
- 7 you.
- 8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: That ends
- 9 public comment and I believe everyone who
- 10 put in a slip had an opportunity to speak,
- 11 even though we went over the 30 minute
- 12 limit.
- 13 We will now go the calendar of
- 14 November 21st. There are several items that
- 15 are part of the consent calendar. I will
- 16 read those items and, by consent, that means
- 17 both sides of the aisle have agreed to the
- 18 items and so we can block all of those items
- 19 in one vote.
- 20 Beginning with Item 4, Ordinance
- 21 182; Item 5, Ordinance 183; Item 6,
- 22 Ordinance 184; Item 7, Ordinance 185; Item
- 23 8, Ordinance 186; Item 9, Ordinance 187;
- 24 Item 10, Ordinance 188; Item 11, Ordinance
- 25 189; Item 12, Ordinance 190; Item 13,

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Ordinance 191; Item 14, Ordinance 192; Item
- 3 15, Ordinance 193; Item 16, Ordinance 194;
- 4 Item 17, Ordinance 195; Item 18, Ordinance
- 5 196; Item 19, Ordinance 197; Item 20,
- 6 Ordinance 198; Item 21, Ordinance 199; Item
- 7 22, Ordinance 200; Item 23, Ordinance 201;
- 8 Item 24, Ordinance 202;
- 9 Item 25, Resolution 180; Item 27,
- 10 Resolution 182; Item 28, Resolution 183;
- 11 Item 29, Resolution 184; Item 30, Resolution
- 12 185; Item 31, Resolution 186; Item 31,
- 13 Resolution 186; Item 32, Resolution 187;
- 14 Item 33, Resolution 188; Item 34, Resolution
- 15 189; Item 35, Resolution 190; Item 36,
- 16 Resolution 191; Item 37, Resolution 192;
- 17 Item 38, Resolution 193; Item 39, Resolution
- 18 194; Item 40, Resolution 196; Item 41,
- 19 Resolution 196; Item 42, Resolution 197;
- 20 item 43, Resolution 198; Item 44, Resolution
- 21 199; Item 45, Resolution 200; Item 46,
- 22 Resolution 201; Item 47, Resolution 202;
- 23 Item 48, Resolution 203; Item 49, Resolution
- 24 204.
- Motion, please.

1 Full Legislature/11-21-16 2 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved. 3 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Second. 4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator 5 6 Nicolello. 7 I believe since they have been 8 vetted in the committees and as part of the 9 consent calendar, all those in favor of the 10 items that were just called, signify by 11 saying aye. 12 (Aye.) 13 Any opposed? 14 (No verbal response.) 15 The items pass unanimously. 16 Now we go to the non-consent 17 items and that begins with Hearing Number 1 on a local law. 18 19 Mr. Pulitzer, read the item and 20 call for a motion to open. Item 1. 21 MR. PULITZER: Thank you. Item 22 Number 1 on the calendar is a hearing on a 23 proposed local law, Clerk Item 540, a local 24 law to authorize a voluntary partial amnesty

program for income producing property owners

25

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 that are liable to pay fines pursuant to the
- 3 Nassau County Administrative Code, Section
- $4 \quad 6 30$
- 5 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: A motion
- 6 to open the hearing.
- Motion, please.
- 8 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.
- 9 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Second.
- 10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
- 11 Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator
- 12 Gaylor. All those in favor of opening the
- 13 hearing signify by saying aye.
- 14 (Aye.)
- Any opposed?
- 16 (No verbal response.)
- 17 The hearing is open.
- 18 Who is here to speak on this
- 19 item?
- MR. ARCURI: Hi. My name is
- 21 Anthony Arcuri. I have my colleague John
- 22 Bollinini here from the Department of
- 23 Assessment.
- 24 At this point, I would like to
- 25 give you a brief rundown of the incoming

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 expense statements, we call them the ASIE.
- 3 The purpose of the annual survey of incoming
- 4 expense is to comply with the stipulations
- 5 set forth in Section 6-30 of the Nassau
- 6 County Administrative Code while ensuring
- 7 the collection of usable income and expense
- 8 data in a minimally intrusive manner.
- 9 To facilitate this, owners of
- 10 Class 4, commercial rent producing
- 11 properties are asked to participate in the
- 12 valuation process by reporting their numbers
- 13 and expenses to the agency.
- 14 The Nassau County Department of
- 15 Assessment collects this income and expense
- 16 data on an annual basis through its survey.
- 17 The purpose of the survey is to
- 18 gather data for statistical analysis that
- 19 will establish the full market value of all
- 20 income generating properties.
- 21 The requested information is not
- 22 used directly to determine the assessed
- 23 value of the reporting property, rather the
- 24 data is collected and used to analyze
- 25 changes and trends in the levels of income

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 and expense of similar rent producing
- 3 properties both locally and county wide.
- 4 The information provided aids the
- 5 department in the development of schedules
- 6 and guidelines that result in fairer and
- 7 more equitable assessed values for all
- 8 property types.
- In 2013, the INE Law was passed
- 10 by the Legislature requiring all Class 4
- 11 income producing properties to file an
- 12 income and expense statement, ASIE, with the
- 13 Department of Assessment.
- 14 The law provided, if properties
- 15 failed to submit a survey, they would be
- 16 subject to a monetary penalty. The number
- 17 of filings received by the department was
- 18 somewhat impacted by the temporary
- 19 retraining order in 2014. The TRO has since
- 20 been lifted.
- The law before you today allows
- 22 commercial non filers due process, entitles
- 23 them to hearings, and to participate in an
- 24 amnesty program.
- 25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Minority

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Leader.
- 3 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Good
- 4 afternoon. I didn't catch your name.
- 5 MR. ARCURI: Anthony Arcuri.
- 6 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Nice to
- 7 meet you. I just have a couple of questions
- 8 but obviously I want to clarify for the
- 9 record that this is a -- the Legislature is
- 10 embarking on a partial amnesty as it relates
- 11 to fines that are liable for payment -- pay
- 12 for statements due between 2014, 2015, 2016
- and provided that owners would pay 75
- 14 percent of that fine which would meet their
- 15 full satisfaction. Am I understanding this
- 16 correctly?
- 17 MR. ARCURI: Correct.
- 18 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So, my
- 19 first question becomes, this covers periods
- 20 2014, '15 and '16?
- 21 MR. ARCURI: Yes. The calendar
- 22 year, yes. We are asking, let's say, in '14
- 23 for the '13 data. Today we're asking for
- 24 the '15 data because the '16 is not
- 25 completed yet.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: What has
- 3 been the compliance rate with those that
- 4 have met that criteria for submitting that
- 5 information since 2014?
- 6 MR. ARCURI: Actually I have
- 7 prepared a 13 year study going back to 2003,
- 8 but let's address the more recent filers.
- 9 For the 2013 which would be
- 10 calendar '14, so let's talk calendar years
- 11 from now on. So 2014, 66 percent
- 12 compliance; for 2014, 69 percent compliance.
- 13 And for 2013, 56 percent compliance.
- 14 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Any
- 15 perspective on the decrease from 2015 to
- 16 2016?
- 17 MR. ARCURI: The year is still
- 18 open. We looked at filers and people filed
- 19 over the weekend, filed today. There would
- 20 be late filers, but the filings are coming
- 21 in. So cumulatively, over a period of time,
- 22 the '16 filers might catch up.
- LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: The county,
- 24 as you well know, has determined that they
- 25 plan to generate revenue from this

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 particular program.
- 3 You had just identified that the
- 4 county is at 56 percent compliance in fiscal
- 5 year 2016.
- 6 What would this amnesty bring
- 7 that compliance rate up to? What are we
- 8 looking to try to accomplish for those years
- 9 going back from '14, '15, and '16? Five
- 10 percent on each year? I'm trying to get an
- 11 idea of what we're talking about.
- MR. ARCURI: I really cannot
- 13 speculate to that, but I can tell you this.
- 14 In calendar year 2008, the department
- 15 imposed a penalty for non filers. In that
- 16 year we had 82 percent compliance.
- 17 The following year when there was
- 18 no penalty we had 80 percent compliance and
- 19 it has been trailing off ever since.
- The farther we got away from a
- 21 monetary penalty, you got that first uptick,
- 22 and from that moment on it's been trailing
- 23 off to what we have now. So I think the
- 24 trend speaks --
- 25 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I see what

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 you mean. I don't know if you can answer
- 3 this because obviously I would need somebody
- 4 from the administration to answer it.
- 5 From our standpoint this seems to
- 6 be something that is being proposed to fill
- 7 a budget gap.
- 8 As you probably well know, and
- 9 not to look at things in a vacuum, but the
- 10 county is reducing the public safety fee
- 11 from \$105 to \$55. By doing that, they are
- 12 also proposing this to fill the budget gap.
- 13 I know you can't really answer that.
- 14 Mr. Becker, is there somebody
- 15 here from the administration that can help
- 16 us understand why we should consider a one
- 17 shot for today? That's my question.
- MR. BECKER: Legislator Abrahams,
- 19 I would have to take that back. I don't
- 20 think they were prepared to answer that
- 21 question, so I'm going to have to get that
- 22 information upstairs and get a response for
- 23 you.
- 24 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Is
- 25 Mr. Naughton here today?

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 MR. BECKER: Let me see if he's
- 3 available to come down.
- 4 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I just want
- 5 to make sure I understand. Is this
- 6 perceived as a one shot? It seems to me
- 7 that this is an amnesty program that is
- 8 going into effect for fiscal year 2017 for
- 9 calendar year 2016. Do we plan to see this
- 10 revenue on a going forward basis?
- 11 MR. BECKER: Let me see if I can
- 12 get Mr. Naughton to come down.
- 13 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: While you
- 14 do that, and I can't see behind you, Fran,
- is Maurice Chalmers here?
- 16 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Hold on.
- 17 Mr. Kopel has a response to that.
- 18 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I'm not
- 19 looking -- no disrespect to Mr. Kopel but --
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: If you
- 21 need Mr. Chalmers --
- 22 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Madam
- 23 Presiding Officer, no disrespect to
- 24 Mr. Kopel, but I'm not seek seeking nor
- 25 looking for his response.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I would
- 3 rather that you go through the chair to have
- 4 Mr. Chalmers come up and address us.
- 5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So, do you
- 6 want me to hold off on Mr. Chalmers, I can
- 7 continue my questioning?
- 8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Yes.
- 9 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Sure.
- 10 MR. BECKER: Madam Chair, I'm
- 11 going to get Mr. Naughton down.
- 12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: As quickly
- 13 as possible, please.
- 14 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Okay. Sir,
- 15 we have to hold off on Mr. Chalmers now.
- 16 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Mr. Arcuri,
- 17 Legislator Kopel wants to elaborate on what
- 18 you just said.
- 19 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Madam
- 20 Presiding Officer, I wasn't done with
- 21 Mr. Arcuri yet. You said to hold off on my
- 22 questioning for Mr. Chalmers and go through
- 23 the chair.
- 24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: You're not
- 25 finished?

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: No.
- 3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Go ahead.
- 4 And then Mr. Kopel will go. Certain things
- 5 he wants to clear up.
- 6 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Mr. Arcuri,
- 7 I'm sorry to put you at such a disadvantage.
- 8 Just one thing as far as a programmatic
- 9 standpoint.
- 10 The report that you had
- 11 referenced that talked about going back a
- 12 few years, can you provide that to my
- 13 finance director, Michelle Darcy? I don't
- 14 know if you have the copy with you there or
- 15 not, I know Mr. Naughton is not here with
- 16 us, but if you do have that that would be
- 17 ideal. Hold on one second.
- We just want to make sure, you
- 19 had mentioned -- that's the report?
- 20 Michelle will come down and grab that and
- 21 make a copy. You mentioned the TRO is now
- 22 lifted. We just want to make sure --
- 23 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Mr. Arcuri,
- 24 do you have another copy of that?
- 25 Mr. Becker, would you please bring that copy

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- of Mr. Arcuri's statement here? He has a
- 3 listing of all.
- 4 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: He has the
- 5 report. I just have one or two more follow
- 6 up questions for Mr. Arcuri and then I will
- 7 be able to wrap it up.
- 8 The first one, you had mentioned
- 9 in your opening comments that the TRO has
- 10 been lifted and I just wanted to make sure
- 11 we understand from your perspective being
- 12 from where you are in the department that
- 13 there are no other legal challenges out
- 14 there to the law. Mr. Denion can answer I
- 15 guess.
- MR. DENION: Conal Denion, County
- 17 Attorney's Office. The legal challenge that
- 18 was brought by the Bening, the last name,
- 19 plaintiffs, is on appeal. They've appealed
- 20 that. The county was successful at the
- 21 Supreme Court but that is on appeal so that
- 22 is ongoing. There is no TRO but they have
- 23 brought an appeal in the case.
- 24 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Mr. Arcuri,
- 25 according to our notes, we were looking at

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Mr. Chalmers' report and I will have
- 3 Mr. Chalmers come up later to explain it as
- 4 well, but it indicates that the department
- 5 used a .5 percent penalty in their
- 6 calculation for survey year 2013.
- 7 It's not clear why but it looks
- 8 like the .75 was not used when it should
- 9 have been which, based off the calculations
- 10 in the Mr. Chalmers' report from Independent
- 11 Budget Review, is a \$9 million difference.
- 12 Can you clarify that for us?
- MR. ARCURI: Yes. Any
- 14 percentages of fines or penalties that we
- 15 used are on advice from the County
- 16 Attorney's Office.
- 17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I quess
- 18 that points it to Mr. Denion.
- 19 MR. DENION: Unfortunately I was
- 20 not part of that advice but we will find out
- 21 about that for you and get back to you.
- 22 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I think
- 23 that's tremendously important to understand
- 24 why the county in this program is not
- looking at \$9.9 million in additional

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 revenue. Who was a part of that discussion?
- 3 MR. DENION: I'll have to get
- 4 back to you on that. I know I wasn't part
- 5 of it.
- 6 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I would
- 7 say, obviously I know Mr. Kopel has
- 8 questions, and I have greater questions too,
- 9 but I would consider that we motion to table
- 10 while we're waiting to get this information.
- 11 This is \$9.9 million that the
- 12 Office of Legislative Budget Review has
- identified and it cover some of the very
- 14 same youth services that I think we're
- 15 advocating for today. Yes, this is a
- 16 hearing.
- 17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: The
- 18 hearing is ongoing so there is no need to
- 19 table it.
- MR. DENION: We will try to get
- 21 you an answer as soon as possible.
- 22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Are vou
- 23 finished with your questions of Mr. Arcuri?
- 24 Are you finished with Mr. Arcuri so that
- 25 Legislator Kopel can ask his questions?

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I am done
- 3 questioning but I think what we would like
- 4 to see happen and, obviously I know there
- 5 are other members who want to question, but
- 6 what we would like to see happen, unless the
- 7 information is forthcoming before this
- 8 hearing is over, that we recess the /HRAERG
- 9 or what's the proper procedure, table?
- 10 We'll recess the hearing until we get the
- 11 proper answers, then reopen the hearing once
- 12 we get the answers to our satisfaction.
- I think that's the best way to
- 14 proceed. You just heard from youth board
- 15 agency groups that came here pleading their
- 16 case and it seems like to me, based off the
- 17 report that's been put together by OLBR, it
- 18 looks like the county could be not utilizing
- 19 this 9 and a half million dollars.
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 21 Kopel.
- 22 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Good
- 23 afternoon, Mr. Arcuri. Let me just check
- 24 one or two things with you please.
- 25 First of all, a good deal of that

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 money is already due, so we're -- just the
- 3 effect of this would be simply to forgive
- 4 part of it but to hurry it up, just in terms
- 5 of the cash.
- The next question is this. Can
- 7 one do an accurate assessment roll without
- 8 this information?
- 9 MR. ARCURI: The richer the body
- 10 of information that we get, the better
- 11 assessment roll we can produce.
- 12 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: So it would be
- 13 fair to say, would it, not that the lack of
- 14 this information from all of the people who
- 15 have not been producing it is essentially
- 16 raising havoc with our assessment system
- 17 altogether. In other words, a lot of the
- 18 claims may be happening simply because we're
- 19 just not getting the right information?
- MR. ARCURI: Again, we do not use
- 21 the -- it's not a one for one relationship.
- 22 We don't get an income and expense statement
- 23 in our hand and go and use that to create a
- 24 value. The more of them we get in our hand
- 25 the more statistics --

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: I understand.
- 3 But if we are missing 20 percent of the
- 4 information, we've got a problem?
- 5 MR. ARCURI: Yes. The richer the
- 6 statistics --
- 7 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: And that would
- 8 tend to produce errors in the system
- 9 naturally?
- MR. ARCURI: As an assessor, I
- 11 would tend to agree with you, sir.
- 12 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: An important
- 13 reason at least from my perspective and I'm
- 14 sure many others would, in trying to get
- 15 this hurried up, we are bringing in more
- 16 information and then going forward. We are
- 17 doing a better system. We have better
- 18 information. We are producing more accurate
- 19 tax roll which causes less problems in the
- 20 future.
- 21 Instead of waiting for whatever
- 22 court cases there are to wind their way
- 23 through the system, we are getting the
- 24 information now and that's a helpful thing
- 25 from my perspective.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- MR. ARCURI: Yes, we definitely
- 3 need the information to do our jobs
- 4 correctly.
- 5 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Now, do you
- 6 have to have a feel for I guess the other
- 7 comparable jurisdiction in a way would be
- 8 New York City?
- 9 MR. ARCURI: I'm employed by
- 10 Nassau County for 12 years. In those 12
- 11 years, I have in director of the income and
- 12 expense unit. Prior to that, I was employed
- 13 by New York City, by the Department of
- 14 Finance.
- 15 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: So you've got
- 16 a great feel for it, how was their
- 17 compliance?
- MR. ARCURI: I was director of
- 19 their income and expense unit for five years
- 20 before I came here.
- 21 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: So why don't
- 22 you go ahead and contrast what's going on
- 23 there and what's going on here in terms of
- 24 compliance and penalties and so forth.
- 25 MR. ARCURI: Extremely high

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 compliance in New York City. There is a
- 3 penalty based on percent of value much like
- 4 the penalty proposed here.
- 5 The biggest difference is, if you
- 6 fail to file an RPIE, that's what the city
- 7 calls it, Real Property Income Expense
- 8 statement, if you fail to file that, you do
- 9 not qualify to grieve your assessment for
- 10 that year.
- 11 That fosters a situation where
- 12 you have very high percentages of
- 13 compliance.
- 14 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: And, as a
- 15 result of that, would you say that they have
- 16 less grievances?
- MR. ARCURI: Oh, yes.
- 18 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: As a result of
- 19 the compliance?
- 20 MR. ARCURI: And less successful
- 21 ones as well.
- 22 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: And less
- 23 successful ones because, A, people comply
- 24 because people don't want to have a fine
- and, B, because they don't want to lose the

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 right to grieve their right if it's wrong,
- 3 and, as a result, we just get a much better
- 4 tax roll.
- 5 MR. ARCURI: That's correct.
- 6 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: And that's
- 7 what we're trying to achieve over here as
- 8 our primary result of trying to speed up all
- 9 this compliance.
- I think I've got what I need.
- 11 Thank you, sir.
- 12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES:
- 13 Mr. Naughton is here if you would like to
- 14 ask. Who had questions of Mr. Naughton?
- 15 Mr. Naughton, you're here. He's at the
- 16 podium.
- 17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: How are
- 18 you, Eric.
- 19 MR. NAUGHTON: Good afternoon,
- 20 how are you?
- 21 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Good. Can
- 22 you explain the financing of this amnesty
- 23 program? Forgive me if this question came
- 24 up, I was in the back.
- 25 There's been a lot of discussion

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 that this is a perceived one shot in terms
- 3 of revenue.
- 4 First, can you confirm what the
- 5 program will generate in revenue?
- 6 MR. NAUGHTON: As you are well
- 7 aware, this item was not proposed by the
- 8 administration. This was an amendment
- 9 proposed by the majority.
- 10 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I do know.
- 11 MR. NAUGHTON: So we have not
- 12 performed any analysis on this item. Our
- 13 budget did not include it. So we had
- 14 suggested -- we had a proposed budget that
- included a public safety fee.
- 16 NIFA has now issued a letter to
- 17 both leaders stating that the inclusion of
- 18 this will be rejected and we will have to
- 19 deal with that as it should happen by this
- 20 committee.
- 21 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So let's
- 22 just backtrack one second. As you well
- 23 know, the public safety fee was \$105 as
- 24 proposed by the administration.
- MR. NAUGHTON: Correct.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: It is now
- 3 being proposed at \$55.
- 4 MR. NAUGHTON: Yes.
- 5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: The loss of
- 6 that revenue is how much?
- 7 MR. NAUGHTON: \$36 million.
- 8 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So
- 9 understanding that you have not had a chance
- 10 to review it, I guess the question is more
- 11 posed to the majority, in regards to does
- 12 this proposal generate \$36 million? I guess
- 13 it really begs the question of, also, I
- 14 don't know if Legislative Budget Review has
- 15 had a -- Maurice, have you had a chance --
- 16 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I'm going
- 17 to call Mr. Chalmers to the podium. He can
- 18 answer the questions you are asking
- 19 Mr. Naughton. So I will call Mr. Chalmers
- 20 to the podium to answer those questions.
- LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS:
- 22 Mr. Naughton, just a quick question. It
- 23 came up a little earlier in regards to the
- 24 penalty the department is using.
- 25 As far as I know, the assessment

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 department reports to the County Executive,
- 3 but it talked about the use of the penalty
- 4 being .5 and not .75. Are you familiar with
- 5 how that number was determined?
- 6 Mr. Denion said it was discussion
- 7 with the County Attorney's Office, higher
- 8 than himself, but just trying to get some
- 9 answers.
- MR. NAUGHTON: Myself nor anyone
- 11 from OMB was involved in any of those
- 12 discussions.
- 13 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So I'm just
- 14 curious then, because Mr. Denion said it was
- 15 a discussion with the County Attorney
- 16 earlier.
- 17 How can the County Attorney have
- 18 a discussion about something that's fiscal
- 19 without yourself or Roseann there?
- 20 MR. NAUGHTON: I believe the
- 21 discussion was to assist the majority and
- 22 coming up with ways, different alternatives,
- 23 so that's why it did not include the rest of
- 24 the administration.
- 25 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 understand, but wouldn't the finance arm of
- 3 the administration be vital to providing the
- 4 majority with the information of how much
- 5 this generates and the methodology on .5
- 6 versus .75?
- 7 MR. NAUGHTON: I think their
- 8 staff has enough knowledge to figure that
- 9 out without us.
- 10 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Without
- 11 you. Okay. I guess the question we have to
- 12 figure out is and it's really pointed to the
- 13 Presiding Officer, why are we using that
- 14 penalty number and not the other number?
- 15 But, thank you, Mr. Naughton. I guess
- 16 Mr. Chalmers.
- 17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: We're
- 18 waiting for Mr. Chalmers to come up.
- 19 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Madam
- 20 Presiding Officer, I don't know if you're
- 21 going to give me an answer on that one.
- 22 MR. CHALMERS: Maurice Chalmers,
- 23 budget review.
- 24 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Maurice, a
- 25 couple of things. As you heard from Mr.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Naughton, his office has not looked at what
- 3 this particular amnesty program will
- 4 generate in revenue.
- 5 It has been said and well
- 6 documented that, of course by NIFA, that
- 7 going from \$105 public safety fee, to \$55,
- 8 the county will lose \$36 million.
- 9 MR. CHALMERS: About \$35.4
- 10 million, \$36 million, yes.
- 11 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So looking
- 12 at this particular program, this program
- 13 would generate how much revenue?
- 14 MR. CHALMERS: Well, the universe
- 15 for the server years, '13, '14, and '15, we
- 16 estimate to be approximately \$70.4 million
- 17 for those three years. That's the universe.
- 18 Estimating that we have 100 percent
- 19 participation.
- In addition to your point of what
- 21 you are talking about, the data we got has a
- 22 final .5 percent for 2013. So it was a more
- 23 conservative number. We actually
- 24 highlighted that there could be an
- 25 additional opportunity once that is

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 clarified of the \$9.9 million you are
- 3 talking about. The \$9.9 million will be
- 4 above the \$70.4 million.
- 5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I see. You
- 6 are saying a lot of interesting things,
- 7 Maurice. I want to make sure I can capture
- 8 all of them.
- 9 So the county's universe, the
- 10 most the county can collect, and that's
- 11 assuming everything lines up perfectly for
- 12 us is roughly \$70.4 million?
- MR. CHALMERS: That's correct.
- 14 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I think Mr.
- 15 Arcuri had mentioned before that the last
- 16 time the county imposed some penalty to
- 17 certain degrees, they were able to generate,
- 18 I thought you said 82 percent, the number in
- 19 2008.
- 20 Have you looked at any of that
- 21 information to determine what the county
- 22 would actually --
- MR. CHALMERS: What we got was
- 24 property specific information. Those are
- 25 the properties that actually owe us money.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 So those are really specific. Those are I
- 3 guess the balance of the 82 percent and the
- 4 18 percent that did not comply.
- 5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I
- 6 understand. If we have the 70.4 and then
- 7 looking at the .5, which, doing the math,
- 8 that gets us to 35.4, \$36 million, going
- 9 forward to future years, how is this not a
- 10 one shot in revenue if we're dwindling down
- 11 off of that \$70 million? Are we expecting
- 12 it to be replenished with more delinquent
- 13 people to the same magnitude in the future?
- 14 MR. CHALMERS: We expect the
- 15 majority of it to be a one shot. There
- 16 could be an aspect of it where some property
- 17 owners may decide not to provide the
- 18 information and that could be recurring. We
- 19 have no way of saying how much of it could
- 20 be recurring.
- 21 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So would
- 22 \$36 million recur?
- MR. CHALMERS: Probably not.
- 24 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Would \$20
- 25 million recur?

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 MR. CHALMERS: Again, without --
- 3 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I guess
- 4 what I'm driving at is that, is this more
- 5 one shot than recurring?
- 6 MR. CHALMERS: Most of it will
- 7 not be recurring revenue. What we
- 8 highlighted also was the cost avoidance
- 9 also. We actually pay a lot of money on tax
- 10 certs, commercial tax cert and we could have
- 11 an opportunity for cost avoidance going
- 12 forward. That may not a revenue item, but
- 13 it can also be a cost avoidance.
- 14 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 15 Ford.
- 16 LEGISLATOR FORD: Just following
- 17 along this line of questioning, basically
- 18 this could be a one shot deal, so that the
- 19 \$36 million or \$40 million --
- MR. CHALMERS: Or 70.
- 21 LEGISLATOR FORD: -- we could
- 22 collect it, say, in 2017. So then as
- 23 Legislator Kevan Abrahams was saying, then
- 24 maybe in 2018, we may not have as many
- 25 businesses that are not in compliance so

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 that we may not be looking at recouping \$70
- 3 million or 36.
- 4 But you did indicate though that
- 5 because more companies would be in
- 6 compliance, we would have less grievances so
- 7 that if we owed \$80 million in tax certs out
- 8 which we have to pay back, instead of that
- 9 being \$80 million, that could be reduced to
- 10 say \$15 million and we save the \$65 million
- 11 and that's recurring?
- MR. CHALMERS: That's the cost
- 13 avoidance proponent of this local law.
- 14 LEGISLATOR FORD: Thank you very
- much.
- 16 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Denise,
- just to wrap up my point, and I agree with
- 18 what is being said, but what I'm saying is,
- 19 you're take a three-year period of \$70.4
- 20 million, I understand that you're going to
- 21 have a higher compliance rate going forward,
- 22 we get that. But, unless the 70.4
- 23 represented one year, you're not going to be
- 24 able to make that all up. That's three
- 25 years. That's what I'm saying.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: And you're
- 3 correct except that the hope is, and the
- 4 plan is that we won't have to.
- In other words, when we have a
- 6 higher compliance, we have less of a need
- 7 for refunds. So you have a higher
- 8 compliance, you're making up that much money
- 9 and perhaps more, on the other end, by not
- 10 having to worry about the refunds. So your
- 11 budget is going to come in fine.
- 12 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: When you
- 13 say your budget, are you saying the county
- 14 budget or as it pertains this item?
- 15 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: No, no. The
- 16 county budget. In other words, you're not
- 17 going to get this particular income next
- 18 time, we hope, but on the expense side of
- 19 the ledger, you are going to be eliminating
- 20 expense.
- So, yes, the income side of the
- ledger goes down but so does the expense
- 23 side of the ledger. If things work out
- 24 well, you're doing the right thing, the
- 25 smart thing, that way. Would that be fair,

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Maurice?
- 3 MR. CHALMERS: I think that's
- 4 fair.
- 5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: If I'm
- 6 understanding what you're saying, obviously
- 7 I agree with you that we will have a more
- 8 accurate assessment roll to be able to -- I
- 9 just don't believe that through that
- 10 efficiency that we are going to generate or
- 11 have efficiencies that generate to the tune
- of \$36 million which sounds like to me
- 13 that's what the number is starting in fiscal
- 14 year 2017.
- 15 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Well, except,
- 16 by the way, we're not going to get 100
- 17 percent compliance or anything like it, just
- 18 by the nature of things. So, there will be
- 19 some, regardless of whatever we don't
- 20 collect now, we still have it going forward
- 21 in the future we can collect that. So at
- 22 some point you're right, that in a perfect
- 23 world, that money goes away. We can't
- 24 project it that far into the future I don't
- 25 think. By doing this, in getting that

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 money, you're reducing your costs going
- 3 forward.
- 4 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: The Amnesty
- 5 program, as it stands alone, not trying to
- 6 balance the budget, I think I agree with
- 7 your sentiments.
- 8 That being said, when you're
- 9 trying to balance the budget, which is
- 10 obviously billions of dollars, it seems to
- 11 me for the same concerns that NIFA has had,
- 12 it runs into a very hazy matter where NIFA
- 13 has indicated that they would reject this
- 14 proposal if it tries to do that.
- I think if you tried to do this
- 16 while keeping the budget balanced, I don't
- 17 think we would be at the position where NIFA
- 18 is threatening further action.
- 19 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: The problem
- 20 with NIFA, if you'll forgive me and they'll
- 21 forgive me, is that a lot of things they do
- 22 are very hazy and not necessarily based upon
- 23 logic and not based upon the correct
- 24 accounting and the correct thinking. So
- 25 that doesn't necessarily impress me all that

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 much.
- 3 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Look, I'm
- 4 probably one of the few members outside of
- 5 Rich, Norma, Dennis, that was here when NIFA
- 6 was here from its origination.
- 7 So I can tell you, I've seen it
- 8 change, I've seen it morphed, and I've seen
- 9 it do different things, but NIFA, one thing
- 10 I do know, is that scary, the four of us are
- 11 the only ones that are here, and Vinnie,
- 12 sorry, but I will say -- my point is that
- 13 obviously they are here and we have to deal
- 14 with them, regardless of whether we believe
- 15 they are hazy or inconsistent, whatever may
- 16 be the case, we have to deal with them.
- 17 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: We have to do
- 18 the right thing.
- 19 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I
- 20 understand that, Howard, but they've made a
- 21 very strong point to myself, as well to
- 22 Madam Presiding Officer as well as to the
- 23 entire Legislature about their disagreement
- 24 on this particular item.
- I think if it stood alone, and it

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 wasn't trying to balance the budget, I don't
- 3 think we would receive that letter.
- 4 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: You're right,
- 5 but we are an elected body and we have the
- 6 responsibility to make these decisions on
- 7 behalf of our constituents and on behalf of
- 8 the entire county.
- 9 They are an unelected body.
- 10 There are some, may I say, can I be bold to
- 11 say there might be some political
- 12 influences. But I think that what we need
- 13 to do is simply adhere to sensible budgetary
- 14 practices.
- 15 If NIFA comes out with some good
- 16 ideas and good suggestions, that's great.
- 17 We will thank them and kiss them on both
- 18 cheeks so to speak. That's not what I'm
- 19 hearing.
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Do you
- 21 have any other questions for Mr. Chalmers?
- 22 Legislator DeRiggi-Whitton, do you have
- 23 question for Mr. Chalmers:
- LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: No.
- 25 But can I ask the County Attorney to step

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 forward again if that's possible?
- 3 Hi. I know there was a question
- 4 as to what happened to the fines during the
- 5 period of the TRO. Were they being
- 6 accumulated during that time? Can you
- 7 explain that to us?
- MR. DENION: I don't know how
- 9 that was calculated. Tony, did you give a
- 10 grace period for those or not?
- 11 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: Just
- 12 to reiterate, did the fines continue to
- 13 accrue while the TRO was if effect?
- MR. ARCURI: During the TRO,
- 15 people continued to file. That didn't stop
- 16 us from receiving filings even though at
- 17 that time we didn't ask for them.
- 18 As far as the penalty, if you
- 19 didn't file at any period whether there is a
- 20 TRO in effect or not, you're considered not
- 21 compliant so there would be a fine.
- 22 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: That
- 23 seems to go against what the County
- 24 Attorney's Office stated.
- I understand that's the County

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Attorney's position on. The question I
- 3 guess is, do you expect that to be
- 4 challenged because the TRO is in place?
- 5 MR. DENION: Again, I'm not one
- 6 to speculate on that, but I'm not aware of
- 7 any or aware of any challenge on that basis.
- 8 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: It
- 9 has almost been mentioned to our counsel,
- 10 you have no indication of it?
- 11 MR. DENION: I haven't received
- 12 any, no.
- 13 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: Do
- 14 you have any idea what that would add up to
- 15 especially with the commercial properties?
- MR. DENION: I don't know.
- 17 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: So
- 18 the fact that, would you agree that it's
- 19 still a possibility that that could happen.
- MR. DENION: Again, I don't want
- 21 to speculate as to what might happen. I
- 22 don't know.
- LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:
- 24 Would there be anything that would preclude
- 25 the commercial property owners from

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 contesting that those fees,
- 3 MR. DENION: I'm not aware of
- 4 anything that would keep them out of court,
- 5 but I'm not aware of anything that would
- 6 give them success either.
- 7 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: So
- 8 it's another unknown factor I suppose?
- 9 MR. DENION: I wouldn't say
- 10 there's a lot of risk in that. I mean, the
- 11 law is the law. The TRO has been lifted.
- 12 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: The
- 13 question is, during the time of the TRO,
- 14 were those fees legally imposed?
- MR. DENION: Yes. I'm not aware
- 16 of anything that challenges that conclusion.
- 17 They weren't collected during that time of
- 18 course, but once the TRO is lifted, it's
- 19 lifted.
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I have two
- 21 other people here. Legislator MacKenzie.
- 22 LEGISLATOR MACKENZIE: Just to be
- 23 clear, there is no legal impediment to the
- 24 county collecting these fines right now?
- MR. DENION: That's correct.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR MACKENZIE: So the TRO
- 3 is lifted and the county can collect these
- 4 fines and there is nothing legally stopping
- 5 them from doing so?
- MR. DENION: Correct.
- 7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 8 Nicolello.
- 9 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: I just
- 10 wanted to touch base on, with respect to the
- 11 recurring aspects.
- 12 Again, I think this was mentioned
- 13 before but we don't expect the amnesty to be
- 14 100 percent successful?
- MR. CHALMERS: Probably not.
- 16 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: So, to the
- 17 extent it's not successful, '13, '14 and
- 18 '15, the county will still have the ability
- 19 to go after those who have chosen not to
- 20 accept the amnesty?
- 21 MR. CHALMERS: Correct.
- 22 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: When the
- 23 amnesty ends, that will not be the end of
- 24 the collection of '13, '14, '15?
- 25 MR. CHALMERS: No. That will not

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 be the end of it.
- 3 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Your
- 4 office also looked at New York City,
- 5 correct?
- 6 MR. CHALMERS: Yes, we did.
- 7 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: You looked
- 8 at the numbers that New York City has been
- 9 collecting on an annual basis?
- MR. CHALMERS: Yes, we did.
- 11 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Before we
- 12 do that, what's the rate, the cooperation
- 13 rate, I guess if you want to call it that,
- 14 of people actually providing the income and
- 15 expenses to the city?
- MR. CHALMERS: Actually, when you
- 17 go to the fines, we found that approximately
- 18 their success rate is approximately 47.3
- 19 percent. Out of what they bill, they
- 20 collect approximately 47.3 percent.
- 21 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: But the
- 22 compliance rate in terms of businesses
- 23 providing their income and expense
- 24 statements is high?
- MR. CHALMERS: Mid '90s.

```
1
               Full Legislature/11-21-16
2
                LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: So then
3
    the universe, the numbers that they're
4
    actually going after would be five percent,
5
    six percent, something of that nature?
6
                MR. CHALMERS: Correct.
7
                LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Again, as
8
    was just mentioned, the amount that they're
9
    actually collecting from those, that five or
10
    six percent is only, as you said, 47
11
    percent?
12
                MR. CHALMERS: That is correct.
                LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: How much
13
```

MR. CHALMERS: We have the

are they collecting each year?

- 16 percent of the charges with me. I could
- 17 probably get you exactly how much they
- 18 collected. I could get those numbers for
- 19 you and how much was actually collected.
- LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: How much
- 21 are the charges?

14

- MR. CHALMERS: Three percent,
- 23 actually you could go up to three percent,
- 24 four percent, five percent, depending on how
- 25 late you file.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Do we have
- 3 any ideas as to how much they have been
- 4 receiving in terms of these fines that are
- 5 being collected in New York City?
- 6 MR. CHALMERS: I believe it's in
- 7 the mid 20s, like 25 to 30. Mid 20s per
- 8 year.
- 9 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: I guess my
- 10 point is that there is a recurring aspect to
- 11 this. This is not just a generic one shot
- 12 such as we saw in the past days where they
- 13 would sell property and couldn't sell the
- 14 property again?
- MR. CHALMERS: Some business
- 16 owners may make that business decision not
- 17 to provide you that information because they
- 18 don't want you to know it. We can't say how
- 19 much of it would be occurring. There could
- 20 be some aspect of it that is recurring
- 21 although not to the amount that we see for
- 22 those past three years that is actually
- owed, but some aspect of it could be
- 24 recurring.
- 25 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Thank you.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 3 Curran.
- 4 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: I have a few
- 5 points and a couple of questions, so whoever
- 6 is qualified to answer, please decide
- 7 amongst yourselves.
- 8 It does seem to me this is not
- 9 firm, it's shaky revenue no matter how you
- 10 slice it. We can project that we will get
- 11 half the big universe, but we really don't
- 12 know for sure. So that's a possible we have
- 13 to keep in mind and really do have to come
- 14 up with a contingency and that's something
- 15 we will be looking into if this doesn't
- 16 materialize in the coming months.
- 17 Also, something came up very
- 18 interesting to give it more teeth. I wonder
- 19 if we can discuss not letting businesses
- 20 file for a tax grievance if they don't file
- 21 for the following year, if they don't file
- 22 the income and expense report.
- If they don't comply why should
- 24 we be looking to give them a break or
- 25 thinking about getting a break?

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I think
- 3 there are people on this side of the aisle
- 4 who agree they should not be able to file a
- 5 tax grievance. However, we are not too sure
- 6 whether or not we can impose that kind of I
- 7 quess --
- 8 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: You mean
- 9 legally?
- 10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Yes.
- 11 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: Even in the
- 12 city?
- 13 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Our
- 14 counsel was looking into that but it's a
- 15 possibility that we may not be legally able
- 16 to do it. So we are exploring that
- 17 possibility.
- 18 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: That's
- 19 interesting though. So even if the city can
- 20 legally do it, there's a chance that --
- 21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: The city
- 22 can do a heck of a lot more than we can do.
- 23 They don't have a guaranty. They don't have
- 24 to pay back anybody.
- 25 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: That's true.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Now, this is a question I think would be for
- 3 Maurice Chalmers or maybe our finance guys,
- 4 I'm not sure.
- 5 But I see this as possibly
- 6 benefiting, no matter what happens with how
- 7 much revenue we get for this year because it
- 8 is shaky and looks like it's going to be
- 9 mostly a one shot, that it could benefit
- 10 Class 1 property homeowners because it will
- 11 help solve the fundamental problem of base
- 12 proportion.
- 13 As the economy gets better and
- 14 the businesses do better, they would get
- 15 more income -- I know it's not case per case
- 16 but generally the assessment would be higher
- 17 for businesses for Class 4 which could ease
- 18 the burden on Class 1.
- 19 Do you think that that is
- 20 realistic?
- 21 MR. CHALMERS: Well, not being an
- 22 assessor, I would guess that if you fix the
- 23 assessment for Class 4 properties, then the
- 24 base proportion would change accordingly.
- 25 This law, the information allows

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 you to better assess Class 4 properties. So
- 3 that could be a net benefit also of getting
- 4 the information and properly assessing Class
- 5 4 properties.
- 6 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: Right.
- 7 Because we don't have all the information we
- 8 need as the gentleman was saying to properly
- 9 assess Class 4 properties now. This would
- 10 give us more information and with the
- 11 economy improving, businesses doing better,
- 12 could help a little bit the tax burden for
- 13 property one taxpayers, Class 1 taxpayers.
- 14 MR. CHALMERS: I would say yes.
- 15 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: That's
- 16 interesting. Thanks.
- 17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Next I
- 18 have Legislator Rhoads.
- 19 LEGISLATOR RHOADS: Thank you.
- 20 For Mr. Chalmers, I know the discussion came
- 21 up with respect to whether we're basing our
- 22 numerical assumptions on .5 or .75 and I
- 23 believe you had stated for the purpose of
- 24 being more conservative, we use the .5
- 25 figure instead of the .75.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- MR. CHALMERS: The .5 was a
- 3 more conservative approach based on the data
- 4 we got. So we were absolutely okay with it
- 5 if we find out the .75 should have been
- 6 used, the opportunity becomes \$9.9 million.
- 7 LEGISLATOR RHOADS: So in other
- 8 words, the total universe that we're talking
- 9 about as opposed to being 70.4 in theory
- 10 could be 80.3?
- MR. CHALMERS: Correct.
- 12 LEGISLATOR RHOADS: Am I also
- 13 correct in my understanding that we have the
- 14 ability to capture theoretically 100 percent
- of that money through the amnesty program
- 16 and through enforcement mechanisms?
- 17 MR. CHALMERS: That would be the
- 18 entire universe, correct.
- 19 LEGISLATOR RHOADS: In other
- 20 words, the amnesty is proposed, it's 60
- 21 days, that's a voluntary compliance program,
- 22 the estimate city wide is that compliance is
- about 47 percent as you indicated, correct?
- MR. CHALMERS: That's a
- 25 collection rate. The success rate is about

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 47 percent.
- 3 LEGISLATOR RHOADS: However, the
- 4 county still does have the ability under the
- 5 law to actually reduce the outstanding debt
- 6 to a judgement to a judgment and then
- 7 collect on the judgement theoretically to
- 8 capture the remainder?
- 9 MR. CHALMERS: That is correct.
- 10 And the city also, they actually gave us an
- 11 example for 2014 I believe they collected
- 12 almost 6.5, I forget, \$6.7 million, so the
- 13 collection will continue.
- 14 LEGISLATOR RHOADS: So while the
- 15 amnesty itself may be risky in terms of how
- 16 many people wind up voluntarily complying,
- 17 the ability to capture the either 70.4
- 18 million or 80.3 million, depending on what
- 19 we receive, is completely within our
- 20 control, correct?
- 21 MR. CHALMERS: I believe that is
- 22 the case, yes.
- LEGISLATOR RHOADS: Thank you.
- 24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other
- 25 comments or questions from the legislators?

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Legislator Curran.
- 3 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: Since it's
- 4 \$70 million in the universe and we're
- 5 talking about half of that, is that because
- 6 we're basing it on what the city had, about
- 7 half complying? Is that what that's based
- 8 on?
- 9 MR. CHALMERS: What we did was,
- 10 we did a couple of scenarios. We said if we
- 11 were to be 50 percent -- if we have a
- 12 success rate of approximately 50 percent,
- then we would collect I believe it was \$35.2
- 14 million.
- 15 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: Say that
- 16 again.
- 17 MR. CHALMERS: If we had the same
- 18 level of success as the city and we
- 19 collected approximately 50 percent of what
- 20 we billed, then we would get 35.2 million in
- 21 2017.
- 22 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: Thank you.
- 23 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any public
- 24 comment regarding this item? Yes,
- 25 Mr. McCloy.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 MR. MCCLOY: This isn't a topic I
- 3 planned to speak about but it's very much of
- 4 interest. The way it reads is, a local law
- 5 to authorize a voluntary partial amnesty
- 6 program for income producing property
- 7 owners.
- 8 I don't understand as someone who
- 9 is not as involved on this topic as all of
- 10 you are, why there is an amnesty possibility
- 11 at all? It's not like a ticket amnesty
- 12 where summons are issued to people and you
- 13 might not be able to contact them and reach
- 14 out to see if you can collect additional
- 15 income.
- 16 Any property in Nassau County is
- 17 some location an entity that you should be
- 18 able to identify. This should be a topic
- 19 like I mentioned before, everybody on the
- 20 Legislature should be in unanimous agreement
- 21 that if somebody is not in compliance in
- 22 2013 and 2014 and 2015, we'll go after them,
- 23 seize their property and put somebody else
- 24 in the position that they will be
- 25 responsible.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 If you have to pay taxes for 2013
- 3 or 2014 or 2015, you have deadlines to pay
- 4 those taxes. I, as an individual, don't
- 5 understand why amnesty would be granted to
- 6 anyone.
- 7 I think the Legislature should
- 8 put some teeth in this and go after them and
- 9 anybody who is not in compliance with the
- 10 law should receive the wrath of the
- 11 Legislature. I just don't get it.
- I do want to mention to you that
- 13 the assessment situation has been a topic
- 14 that I have been concerned about for many
- 15 years.
- I have spoken to our current
- 17 county executive, the former county
- 18 executive, former assessors, James Davis I
- 19 spoke to Thadeus Jankowski, I spoke to Pat
- 20 Foy. I spoke to their predecessors about
- 21 changing the way the property taxes are
- 22 assessed in my community in Baldwin. There
- 23 are two buildings that were built at the
- 24 same time, that are the same square footage,
- 25 that are mirror imagine identical properties

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 and one pays 60 percent more than the other.
- 3 Based on income generation, which is what
- 4 you're talking about right now. It
- 5 shouldn't be based on income generation, but
- 6 that's a different topic.
- 7 Even if you want to go the route
- 8 of income generation, don't grant them
- 9 amnesty, put some teeth into the Legislature
- 10 and go and grab what's ours. Thank you.
- 11 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 12 Muscarella wants to respond, Mr. McCloy.
- 13 LEGISLATOR MUSCARELLA: I don't
- 14 know if you want an answer, and this is only
- 15 a partial answer.
- 16 From their perspective and from
- 17 our perspective, there's substantial
- 18 litigation going on as to whether or not the
- 19 fines and impositions are proper or not.
- 20 Rather than go through that whole
- 21 procedure which takes a substantial amount
- 22 of time, we are offering those entities to
- 23 say, okay, we'll forego that on an
- 24 individual basis, that appeal process, and
- 25 pay your 75 cents on the dollar.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 We understand that although the
- 3 county believes it's in a very good position
- 4 and we'll win the lawsuit that we are
- 5 entitled to 100 percent, that that takes a
- 6 substantial amount of time to work its way
- 7 through the court system.
- 8 So, we're saying, you know what?
- 9 We'll deal with you, you deal with us. Pay
- 10 us the 75 percent, we'll take it now and
- 11 forego the rest of the 25 percent. You drop
- 12 out of the lawsuit and abide by paying the
- 13 75 cents on the dollar.
- 14 However, those people who don't
- 15 accept that 75 cents on the dollar, if that
- 16 court case works its way through the system
- 17 and ultimately the county prevails on its
- 18 position, we will absolutely go against them
- 19 for 100 percent of what they owe us.
- 20 MR. MCCLOY: I understand what
- 21 you just said, but I just think that from
- 22 the perception the entities that
- 23 accommodated the county and provided the
- 24 information, you make them feel like bad
- 25 behavior is being rewarded.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 I think that it opens the door to
- 3 have a higher number of noncompliant
- 4 individuals in the future which just repeats
- 5 this whole cycle over and over with a
- 6 reducing set of revenue every year. That's
- 7 my personal viewpoint.
- 8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Mr.
- 9 McCloy, Legislator Kopel wants to respond to
- 10 that.
- 11 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: You made some
- 12 interesting points, Mr. McCloy, except that
- 13 I suggest that you be cognizant of several
- 14 possible answers to those.
- 15 First of all, I don't think it's
- 16 going to encourage future disregard of the
- 17 law because 75 percent of a hefty fine is a
- 18 lot more than zero percent of a hefty fine.
- 19 It's still a hefty fine. So what we're
- 20 doing now is, we're discounting what is
- 21 already a hefty fine. Number one.
- Number two, it is possible that
- 23 some people were not entirely aware of the
- 24 new fine, the relatively new fine. It's
- 25 appropriate perhaps at the outset for the

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 first couple of years to grant some
- 3 recognition to that. Maybe they ought to
- 4 have been but they weren't.
- 5 Finally, remember, that there is
- 6 a very significant benefit to the county as
- 7 well. Very, very significant benefit,
- 8 because all the people that are going to pay
- 9 up and do their amnesty, they're going to
- 10 submit their income and expense and we get
- 11 that and we have a much more accurate tax
- 12 roll.
- 13 Remember, the basic purpose of
- 14 this is to avoid a huge expense to the
- 15 county historically, perhaps the largest,
- 16 which is paying back all of this money on
- 17 behalf of, mostly other entities like school
- 18 districts and so forth and so forth, because
- 19 perhaps our tax rolls weren't accurate
- 20 enough. So this is going to save us money.
- 21 All in all, you have a point, but
- 22 I think the better argument is to try to get
- 23 this done. Except that, maybe, sure, we
- 24 would like to get 100 percent but I think it
- 25 makes sense to do it this way.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 MR. MCCLOY: Well, I understand
- 3 your comment also, but I have to take issue
- 4 with one thing. You said that some of these
- 5 individuals involved in this situation might
- 6 not have known about it. Ignorance of the
- 7 law is no excuse.
- 8 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: That's true
- 9 but it happened and it was relatively new.
- 10 Again, we're just, seriously, we're just
- 11 beating the horse here.
- MR. MCCLOY: I just want to
- 13 mention one thing, there are a finite number
- 14 of commercial properties in Nassau County
- and the excuse that some of these people
- 16 might not have known about it doesn't hold
- 17 water. At least to someone like me that
- 18 looks at it more from an outside perspective
- 19 and I let you know why I think that this
- 20 will generate more bad behavior in the
- 21 future, if you feel the advantages outweight
- 22 that, that's fine. I just wanted to let you
- 23 know that this is the right way to do it. I
- 24 think you should go after --
- 25 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: You have given

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 us some very thoughtful and important
- 3 comments. Thanks.
- 4 MR. MCCLOY: Thank you.
- 5 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Ms.
- 6 Mereday.
- 7 MS. MEREDAY: Yes. Where do I
- 8 start? I keep hearing that same theme about
- 9 we're going to be saving money, it's
- 10 generating revenue, going to create all
- 11 these opportunities.
- 12 You can kind of put the blank in
- 13 front of it because the consolidations of
- 14 the police precincts were going to save
- 15 money. It was not going to increase the
- 16 costs for the police officers. It was going
- 17 to increase the aspect of public safety.
- 18 That didn't happen.
- 19 So I think to jump on that
- 20 statement you just made just a few minutes
- 21 ago, Legislator Kopel, about beating the
- 22 horse, yeah, they're going to be some of us
- 23 that are going to continue to beat the
- 24 horse, ring the bell, raise the flag, make
- 25 noise to get the points across to the

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 residents; those that are still staying
- 3 here. Those that don't have to address the
- 4 ongoing squatter issue. And, just to get
- 5 some sense into these programs that are not
- 6 saving us money, not increasing revenue, and
- 7 definitely not bringing down expenses.
- 8 We can talk about the PILOTs that
- 9 aren't working. Again, like I said, the
- 10 consolidations that aren't working. Those
- 11 school cameras that didn't work.
- Now, this amnesty program that is
- 13 slated to be the next end all be all for one
- 14 shot is Minority Leader Abrahams so
- 15 eloquently stated, this alleged 70 million
- 16 dollars of anticipated revenue with the
- 17 annual diminishing return, but I'm pretty
- 18 sure that that enforcement that was
- 19 addressed, that's not going to go down.
- So I'm wondering if one of these
- 21 professional services contract for yet
- 22 another group of legal advisors would be the
- 23 ones that would be assigned to that because
- 24 there was talk about the restraining order
- 25 being lifted but there are appeals in place.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 So that means that there is some type of
- 3 legal entity that we the taxpayers are going
- 4 to be charged with in some form or fashion.
- 5 But, again, it won't be called a
- 6 property tax. It will be called a
- 7 surcharge, a professional services contract,
- 8 it will be called a contract addendum or an
- 9 addition or attachment that again will not
- 10 address the needs, it will not fill a gap
- 11 because you continue to refuse in the
- 12 majority to review the mistakes that you
- 13 have been making on our backs.
- 14 To scrap these bogus one shot
- 15 deals that do not work and then you're going
- 16 to come back with some other title that is
- 17 going to be called a fee or something that
- 18 we're going to be responsible for. So, yes,
- 19 riders up, because the horses are still
- 20 coming out the gate.
- 21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you
- 22 very much, Ms. Mereday.
- There being no other comment, a
- 24 motion to close the hearing.
- 25 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: So moved.

1	Full Legislature/11-21-16
2	LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.
3	CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
4	Legislator Kopel, seconded by Legislator
5	Walker. All those in favor of closing the
6	hearing signify by saying aye.
7	(Aye.)
8	Any opposed?
9	(No verbal response.)
10	The hearing is now closed.
11	Now item Item 2 which is a vote
12	on a proposed local law. Item 2 is a local
13	law to authorize the voluntary partial
14	amnesty program for income producing
15	property owners that are liable to pay fines
16	pursuant to the Nassau County Administrative
17	Code.
18	Motion, please.
19	LEGISLATOR KOPEL: So moved.
20	LEGISLATOR FORD: Second.
21	CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
22	Legislator Kopel, seconded by Legislator
23	Ford. I guess all the comments from the
24	hearing will be transferred into this. Any

25 questions before we close? Minority Leader.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I think
- 3 Ms. Mereday brought up a question earlier, I
- 4 thought she posed it to the majority in
- 5 regards to your discussions with the
- 6 Comptroller.
- 7 Part of the reason why we are
- 8 considering revenue items for the budget
- 9 almost three weeks since we voted for the
- 10 budget is because I believe, Madam Presiding
- 11 Officer, you were having discussions with
- 12 the Comptroller about his proposal for cuts
- 13 across the board to the department.
- So I guess the question proposed
- 15 to the Presiding Officer, to yourself,
- 16 representing the majority, where did -- how
- 17 did you evaluate those --
- 18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: He never
- 19 presented a detailed plan that he proposed
- 20 here at the budget hearing. When he was
- 21 asked about it, he certainly did not
- 22 respond. So, therefore, he did not present
- 23 any detailed plan to resolve the financial
- 24 problems of the budget. That's on the
- 25 record and I will say it ten times. He did

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 not. And we reached out to him and we got
- 3 nada.
- 4 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I'm just
- 5 curious, and obviously you don't have to
- 6 answer this, when did the epiphany of this
- 7 idea come into the majority's mind set?
- It just seems to me, again, we
- 9 lost an opportunity to revalidate confidence
- 10 in the electorate on how Nassau County
- 11 operates and, again, we punted after
- 12 Election Day, after November 8th, when you
- 13 could have considered this proposal,
- 14 reducing the fee to \$55, and to me it
- doesn't sound like a novel idea, it could
- 16 have been done very easily on October 31st,
- 17 so I'm just curious, I mean obviously in
- 18 regards to restoring faith in the
- 19 electorate, when did this idea come about?
- 20 Was this something being considered on
- 21 October 31st?
- 22 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: The only
- 23 thing I can suggest is that we were
- 24 searching and that search is probably not
- 25 over today. We are searching for ways to

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 reduce the public safety fee. This was
- 3 something that came up at the very end. We
- 4 did not have time to do this before October
- 5 31st, but, again, my suspicion is, with this
- 6 budget, this search will not be over today.
- 7 I think this is going to be an ongoing
- 8 process.
- 9 Especially with NIFA's
- 10 involvement, they've inserted themselves in
- 11 the process, they require responses. I
- 12 believe this is not going to be the end.
- MS. MEREDAY: I'm probably out of
- 14 line, I know I am. If there is
- 15 consideration when we can have calls made,
- 16 and I can see that Deputy Presiding Officer
- 17 Kopel, I'm sorry that my appearance
- 18 continues to give you consternation, but you
- 19 just have to get over it, sir.
- 20 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Actually, I
- 21 don't.
- MS. MEREDAY: Okay. Well, I'm
- 23 still here. Anyway, I'm concerned as to why
- 24 other representatives from the county can be
- 25 called if there is a question that pertains

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 to the constituency, but as to Minority
- 3 Leader Abrahams' statement, why can't we
- 4 have a representative from the Comptroller's
- 5 Office, if not the Comptroller here, for
- 6 something this significant? Why can't we
- 7 have him called or someone from his office
- 8 called since he put on the record that he
- 9 had ideas.
- 10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you
- 11 very much. I'm telling you right now, I did
- 12 make a statement just earlier --
- MS. MEREDAY: You made a
- 14 statement.
- 15 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: The presiding
- 16 officer is speaking.
- 17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I'm not
- 18 going to battle with you, Ms. Mereday. He
- 19 had no detailed plan to offer us. Period.
- 20 That's it.
- 21 MS. MEREDAY: The people still
- 22 have a right to speak when and if it's
- 23 necessary they have a right to speak, and
- 24 every one else can get called, but it seems
- 25 to me this would be an opportunity for you

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 at this public setting to have the
- 3 Comptroller who was on the record and said
- 4 he had ideas, to come and address this body
- 5 and the public who stays here on their own
- 6 dime to get an answer from him, a response
- 7 to that.
- 8 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: The
- 9 Comptroller had one concrete suggestion when
- 10 he was before us, and after the fact which
- 11 was, that there is \$100 million or so or
- 12 \$120 million in uncollected tickets over the
- 13 years.
- 14 The truth of the matter is, some
- of them go back for decades and there are
- 16 various amnesties and they are virtually
- 17 uncollectible. He came up and threw out
- 18 this figure and said all this money is
- 19 available.
- The truth of the matter is, on
- 21 our best day, we might be able to collect
- 22 five percent of that.
- So my answer is, basically, he
- 24 did not give us any sort of reasonable
- 25 detailed idea that we can run with.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: If I may,
- 3 before you call the question, I mean, in
- 4 light of what NIFA has indicated to this
- 5 entire Legislative body, I think it's been
- 6 very clear that if this program was to stand
- 7 alone and not be used to balance the budget
- 8 as it's been deemed by NIFA to the tune of
- 9 \$36 million, we already know what we are
- 10 setting up.
- 11 We are setting up a stand off
- 12 between this legislative body, the county,
- 13 and the County Executive. What it will also
- 14 determine is for the very same groups that
- 15 Mr. Naughton has identified in his letter to
- 16 NIFA, those groups will be in jeopardy if we
- 17 decide to go forward with this action.
- I respectfully ask that we table
- 19 this matter and make sure we get the buy-in
- 20 from NIFA as well as from the executive
- 21 branch and all sides to make sure how we
- 22 proceed.
- I think right now what's going to
- 24 end up happening is, NIFA will reject these
- 25 items as they outlined in their letter.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 The County Executive, through
- 3 Mr. Naughton, if Mr. Naughton wants to
- 4 speak, I'm sure he could, through his letter
- 5 has identified how they would close the gap
- 6 if the county went forward with these
- 7 actions, and the same groups that were here
- 8 pleading to us today in the form of youth
- 9 board and bus and all these other groups
- 10 will be left in the cross hairs. We know
- 11 what's going to happen. This script has
- 12 been written before.
- 13 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I now am
- 14 going to ask you one question.
- 15 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I
- 16 respectfully ask that we table this matter.
- 17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: We're not
- 18 going to table. What have you brought to
- 19 the table?
- LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Madam
- 21 Presiding Officer, I'm glad you brought that
- 22 up. We have brought up multiple amendments
- 23 over the period since you have been
- 24 Presiding Officer and you have not called
- 25 one of them.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: That's not
- 3 true.
- 4 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: You have
- 5 not. Then, on top of it, to show your
- 6 partisanship --
- 7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: That's
- 8 your point of view.
- 9 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: We have
- 10 called for an Independent Inspector General,
- 11 something that would generate not only
- 12 transparency in this county, but it would
- 13 also generate --
- 14 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: You want
- 15 to make a motion to table, make a motion to
- 16 table.
- 17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Let me
- 18 finish. You asked me a question.
- 19 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: What did
- 20 you bring to the table?
- 21 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I'm giving
- 22 you examples. What the Inspector General
- 23 will do help, it will help the county recoup
- 24 all of these contracts that are coming up
- 25 that are costing the county money. It would

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 rule out corruption and rule out waste and
- 3 abuse.
- 4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I'm not
- 5 even going to continue the conversation.
- 6 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: We do want
- 7 an Inspector General because it would
- 8 identify contracts which feed your gravy
- 9 train. We get that.
- 10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Governor
- 11 Cuomo recently appointed a director of
- 12 procurement compliance. If it's good enough
- 13 for him it should be good enough for us. At
- 14 that point, the motion to table. S
- 15 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I'll make
- 16 the motion.
- 17 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: I will
- 18 second it.
- 19 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Made by
- 20 Minority Leader Kevan and seconded by
- 21 Legislator Solages.
- 22 All those in favor of tabling
- 23 this item signify by saying aye.
- 24 (Aye.)
- 25 All those opposed?

1	Full Legislature/11-21-16
2	(Nay.)
3	Okay. We need to move on with
4	the business of this county.
5	LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: There are a
6	lot of other ideas that we raised.
7	CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Where are
8	they?
9	LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: Legislator
10	Bynoe has suggested, that Suffolk has tried
11	that raised revenue that Legislator Bynoe
12	raised. There are a lot of ideas that we
13	raised.
14	CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
15	Solages, this is an ongoing process and I
16	would like us to continue and take a vote on
17	the local law creating this amnesty program

for those who are delinquent.

- 19 All those in favor of the local
- 20 law signify by saying aye.
- 21 (Aye.)

18

- 22 Any opposed?
- 23 (Nay.)
- The item passes 12 to 7.
- Next is Item 3, Ordinance 181, an

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 ordinance to amend Ordinance Number 248A
- 3 1987, an ordinance with respect to
- 4 establishing a comprehensive plan for water
- 5 conservation and regulation of water
- 6 throughout Nassau County, including
- 7 provisions for enforcement thereof pursuant
- 8 to Article 12 of the County Government Law
- 9 of Nassau County.
- Motion, please.
- 11 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.
- 12 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: Second.
- 13 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
- 14 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator
- 15 Schaefer. Who is here to speak on this
- 16 item?
- 17 MR. PODLESAK: I am. Gerry
- 18 Podlesak, Deputy County Attorney. County
- 19 Attorney Foskey requested that I speak to
- 20 this item. This item is amending an
- 21 existing ordinance broadening its scope in
- 22 order to address the use of devices to
- 23 prevent irrigation systems, home irrigation
- 24 systems to be activated when there is in
- 25 fact sufficient moisture on lawns, et

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 cetera. It puts the onus upon the
- 3 contractors when they are installing the
- 4 devices to make sure they are contained
- 5 within the systems and when they do repair
- 6 work to make sure such devices are included.
- 7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any
- 8 questions or comments regarding this item?
- 9 Legislator Birnbaum.
- 10 LEGISLATOR BIRNBAUM: I don't
- 11 know if you know this, but do you know what
- 12 the method of enforcement would be for this
- 13 ordinance?
- 14 MR. PODLESAK: The enforcement
- 15 agency is the Consumer Affairs Department.
- 16 There is a request -- a requirement that the
- 17 contractors file reports when they are
- 18 working on systems so that the Consumer
- 19 Affairs Department is advised, and there are
- 20 also penalties for contractors should they
- 21 not make direct filings.
- 22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any other
- 23 questions? Legislator Curran.
- 24 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: Just
- 25 piggybacking on that, the Office of Consumer

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Affairs, do you they have enough personnel
- 3 to do the enforcement?
- 4 MR. PODLESAK: This is a passive
- 5 enforcement. It's a requirement that the
- 6 individual firms that are doing the work
- 7 include the paperwork. The expectation is
- 8 that in order to avoid a fine, it would be
- 9 much easier for the individual contractors
- 10 just to do the correct work and make the
- 11 necessary filings. It's not something where
- 12 it calls for an active enforcement but a
- 13 passive enforcement.
- 14 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: So how would
- it be enforced if it's passive?
- MR. PODLESAK: It's passive. The
- 17 expectation is, the industry is rather
- 18 small. The industry will know the rules and
- 19 the industry will abide by the rules.
- LEGISLATOR CURRAN: How do we
- 21 know if they're not is the thing?
- MR. PODLESAK: The expectation is
- 23 that if it's not, it will somehow become
- 24 apparent to individuals when they see that
- 25 there is a sprinkler system operating during

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 the course of a rainstorm that there
- 3 obviously has been a violation and there
- 4 will be some repercussions.
- 5 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: So people
- 6 calling, neighbors calling, that sort of
- 7 thing?
- 8 MR. PODLESAK: Exactly. Fire
- 9 departments will have the greatest vested
- 10 interest in this because the idea is to make
- 11 sure the water pressure is sufficient.
- I would believe that they would
- 13 take an active role in making sure.
- 14 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: I think that
- 15 this is great. This can preserve a lot of
- 16 water but I would hate to see it be
- 17 toothless.
- MR. PODLESAK: As I said, it's a
- 19 passive methodology.
- LEGISLATOR CURRAN: I hear you.
- 21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- Bynoe.
- LEGISLATOR BYNOE: I have to
- 24 agree with Legislator Curran in that a
- 25 passive process could potentially make this

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 a toothless piece of legislation.
- 3 I think sometimes just going out
- 4 and maybe randomly selecting a contractor
- 5 and going through some of their service
- 6 calls just to verify would a more productive
- 7 way of doing this. But, on a whole other
- 8 note, what about people that are self
- 9 maintaining their properties, irrigation
- 10 system?
- 11 MR. PODLESAK: The legislation
- 12 does not address that.
- 13 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: That's a
- 14 loophole. Because if you're only looking at
- 15 contractors, anyone who might be self
- 16 performing the duties of maintaining their
- 17 irrigation system, would in fact go
- 18 undetected.
- 19 I don't think this is really
- 20 effective. I think we are falling short of
- 21 the intent without having random sampling of
- 22 contractors and maybe someone who is tasked
- 23 with going out in the rain and looking to
- 24 see if someone is in violation or partnering
- 25 with the local village water districts or

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 something more substantive. I think this
- 3 really kind of falls short a little bit.
- 4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator
- 5 Curran.
- 6 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: If I may add,
- 7 I think this is where the one size fits all
- 8 cuts to all departments doesn't necessarily
- 9 work because Consumer Affairs is revenue
- 10 generating these pretty substantial fines
- 11 for people who are not being good stewards
- 12 of our water and I think they should be
- 13 penalized appropriately.
- 14 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: My
- 15 understanding is that these reports have to
- 16 be sworn to by the contractors and that
- 17 there could be -- and the paperwork could be
- 18 called upon by the Department of Consumer
- 19 Affairs, so there's a built in motivation
- 20 for them to comply because obviously if
- 21 they're swearing to something, there's also
- 22 penalties that are involved, the penalties
- 23 in the law.
- MR. PODLESAK: That's correct.
- 25 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: That's it.

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 Thanks.
- 3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: There
- 4 being no other comments or questions from
- 5 the legislators, any public comment?
- 6 (No verbal response.)
- 7 There being none, all those in
- 8 favor of Item 3, Ordinance 42-16 which
- 9 amends Ordinance 248A 1987 signify by saying
- 10 aye.
- 11 (Aye.)
- 12 Any opposed?
- 13 (Nay.)
- 14 The item passes 18 to 1. Am I
- 15 right? Everybody is in their seat.
- We have one more item on today's
- 17 calendar. It's Item 26. The reason why we
- 18 did not include it is because Legislator
- 19 Laura Schaefer has asked to recuse herself.
- That's Item 26, Resolution 181, a
- 21 resolution to authorize the release of the
- 22 surety bond and escrow deposit covering
- 23 improvements of the map of Grand Manor
- 24 Estates situated in the Hamlet of Baldwin,
- 25 town of Hempstead, County of Nassau, New

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 York.
- Motion, please.
- 4 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.
- 5 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: Second.
- 6 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by
- 7 Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator
- 8 Kennedy. Someone from DPW should really be
- 9 here to say whether or not they satisfied
- 10 whatever.
- 11 MR. BECKER: Mr. Katz is here.
- MR. KATZ: Martin Katz, DPW,
- 13 Division of Planning. Yes, the applicant
- 14 satisfied the terms of the bond and we had
- 15 an inspector certify that all public bonded
- 16 items were done to the satisfaction of
- 17 county and all applicable regulations.
- 18 There was no opposition at the Planning
- 19 Commission hearing. It's ready to go.
- 20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any
- 21 questions on this item?
- 22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Are there
- 23 any other comments or questions from the
- 24 legislators?
- 25 (No verbal response.)

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- Is there any public comment?
- 3 Yes, Ms. Mereday.
- 4 MS. MEREDAY: How much? Released
- 5 to who? And what part of the Baldwin does
- 6 this reflect?
- 7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Can you
- 8 answer that question for Ms. Mereday,
- 9 please? It's a surety bond that the county
- 10 holds.
- 11 MR. KATZ: This is one part of
- 12 Baldwin. It's north of Atlantic Avenue, a
- 13 little North of Atlantic Avenue on the west
- 14 side of Grand Avenue. You want the amounts
- 15 and the public bond? The surety bond for
- 16 all public improvements that were bonded is
- in the amount of \$455,458.79. Cash escrow
- 18 in the amount of \$16,148.
- 19 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Great.
- 20 Thank you very much.
- MS. MEREDAY: I still don't know
- 22 what the improvements actually were.
- MR. KATZ: These are all items
- 24 that aren't unit specific, all landscaping
- 25 and fencing and lighting and curbing and

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 roads and drainage, water service.
- 3 Everything that's under the public bond that
- 4 isn't specific to individual lots.
- 5 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: They
- 6 satisfied the project and therefore the
- 7 surety bond is released.
- 8 MS. MEREDAY: I get it but that
- 9 doesn't reflect the issues in terms of
- 10 drainage and street scaping, et cetera,
- 11 that's all of the Baldwin area. So, we're
- 12 trying to understand where this Grand Manor
- 13 portion is because we're still dealing with
- 14 issues between the town and the county on
- 15 the northern part of Baldwin, just south of
- 16 Southern State and north of Sunrise Highway,
- 17 where the county funded project, and we
- 18 still have drainage issues going into the
- 19 shopping center and on a number of streets
- 20 that we get a letter from the County
- 21 Executive. They're telling us it's a town
- 22 road and we get a letter from the Town of
- 23 Hempstead saying it's a county road.
- So that's why I just needed that
- 25 clarification so I can advise the residents

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 of Baldwin as to, again, where our tax
- 3 dollars are going and when they have
- 4 complaints who they can direct it to. Thank
- 5 you.
- 6 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Jack
- 7 McCloy.
- MR. MCCLOY: Ms. Mereday and I
- 9 are both Baldwin residents. We both attend
- 10 many of the local community meetings,
- 11 Baldwin Civic Association meetings, Baldwin
- 12 Oak Civic Association meetings, Baldwin
- 13 Chamber of Commerce meetings, other local
- 14 meetings.
- This particular situation has not
- 16 been voiced and a myriad of community
- 17 projects always come up. I would like on a
- 18 personal level to know exactly where these
- 19 funds are going. I think you know by my
- 20 comments in the past that my concern is,
- 21 when monies are expended, they are expended
- 22 in a fiscally prudent way just because it's
- 23 going to my community doesn't mean I'm for
- 24 it.
- I think it's a good policy to be

```
1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
```

- 2 very specific as to where county funds are
- 3 being spent. I, for one, really don't have
- 4 any clarification, even after the gentleman
- 5 explained how these funds are going to be
- 6 spent, as to where these funds are going. I
- 7 would like it to be tabled and some
- 8 specifics provided to the community.
- 9 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: This is
- 10 money that is owed to the contractor based
- 11 on the fact that the county holds back money
- 12 to make sure that improvements that had to
- 13 be made were made. Since they justified
- 14 those improvements, because DPW does not
- 15 just arbitrarily come and file a resolution
- 16 to release a surety bond, unless they have
- 17 gone out and inspected. Am I correct?
- MR. MCCLOY: I will defer to my
- 19 legislator, are you familiar with the
- 20 specifics, and are you comfortable with
- 21 this?
- 22 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: Yes. This
- 23 came up in committees and I had the very
- 24 same question. This is just like a boiler
- 25 plate thing that happens when there's a

- 1 Full Legislature/11-21-16
- 2 development happening and they're using some
- 3 county resources is the way I understood it
- 4 during committees. I'm comfortable with it.
- 5 MR. MCCLOY: So you're
- 6 comfortable that it's being spent in an
- 7 appropriate fiscally prudent manner?
- 8 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: Yes.
- 9 MR. MCCLOY: I will take your
- 10 word for it. Thank you.
- 11 LEGISLATOR CURRAN: I was
- 12 comfortable because I asked the very same
- 13 questions in committees.
- 14 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: There
- 15 being no other comments or questions, all
- 16 those in favor of Item 26, Resolution 181
- 17 signify by saying aye.
- 18 (Aye.)
- 19 Any opposed?
- 20 (No verbal response.)
- 21 Looks like it's unanimous with
- 22 one recusal, Legislator Schaefer. Call Ms.
- 23 Schaefer back, please.
- 24 That ends the calendar for today,
- November 21st.

1	Ful	- 1	Legis	slature,	/11-21-16	
2	А	mо	tion	to adj	ourn, pleas	se.
3	LI	ΞGΙ	SLATO	OR DUNNI	E: So move	ed.
4	LI	ΞGΙ	SLATO	OR NICO	LELLO: Sed	cond.
5	CI	HAI	RWOMA	AN GONS	ALVES: Mo	ved by
6	Legislator Du	ı n n	e, se	econded	by Legisla	ator
7	Nicolello. A	A 1 1	thos	se in fa	avor of ad	journing
8	the November	2 1	st, 2	2016 me	eting, sign	nify by
9	saying aye.					
10	(7	Ауе	.)			
11	Αı	η	oppos	sed?		
12	(1	0 V	verba	al respo	onse.)	
13	т1	n e	meet	ing is 1	now adjour:	ned. I
14	would like to	o t	ake a	a five n	minute brea	ak.
15	7)	√h e	reupo	on, the	Full Legis	slative
16	Committee ad	jou	rned	at 3:5	4 p.m.)	
17						
18						
19						
20						
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						

1															
2				C E	E R	Т	I :	F I	С	A	Т	E			
3															
4															
5		I,	FRAN	K (G R A	Υ,	a i	Sho	rth	a n	d	Repo	orte	r and	
6	Notar	у Р	ubli	C i	L n	a n d	f	or	the	S	ta	te d	of N	e w	
7	York,	do	her	e b y	7 S	tat	e d	:							
8		ТНА	T I	att	en	d e d	a ·	t t	hе	ti	mе	ano	d pl	асе	
9	above	e me	ntio	n e c	d a	n d	to	o k	ste	nо	gr	aphi	lc r	ecord	Ĺ
10	of th	ie p	roce	e d i	l n g	s i	n ·	the	a b	οv	e -	enti	tle	d	
11	matte	er;													
12		ТНА	T th	e f	for	e g o	in	g t	ran	s c	ri	pt i	ls a	true	:
13	and a	сси	rate	tı	an	scr	ip.	t o	f t	hе	s	ame	a n d	the	
14	whole	t h	ereo	f,	a c	cor	di	n g	to	th	е	best	of	mу	
15	abili	.ty	and	be I	lie	f.									
16		ΙN	WITN	ESS	S W	HER	ΕO	F,	I h	a v	е	here	eunt	o set	
17	my ha	nd	this	9 t	: h	day	0 :	f D	есе	mb	er	, 20	16.		
18															
19					_										
20									FRA	NK	G	RAY			
21															
22															
23															
24															
25															